

**CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA  
DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES  
DIVISION OF PLANNING AND URBAN DESIGN**

**DATE:** October 13, 2020 **FILE:** 20-CM-35

**TO:** Historic Preservation Board

**VIA:** Leslie A. Del Monte, Planning Manager

**FROM:** Julian Gdaniec, Associate Planner

**SUBJECT:** 1001 S Southlake LLC / Kimberly Jones requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a single-family home located at 1001 S Southlake Drive within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

**APPLICANT'S REQUEST**

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a single-family home located within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

**STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition: To be determined by the Historic Preservation Board

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: If Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition is approved, Approval.

**BACKGROUND**

The existing one-story home proposed to be demolished was constructed in 1950 (according to building permit history) on an approximate half acre lot located at 1001 S Southlake Drive. Although built in the 1950's, as evidenced by the building permit search, the home appears to have undergone considerable modification over the years, including exterior alterations. The architectural language of the existing structure exhibits facets of the Mediterranean revival style that is widely experienced in many neighborhoods; not just in Hollywood but a multitude of southern Florida suburbs. It is not particularly unique or exemplary in its current iteration. Furthermore, the State master site file for historic properties does not include any finding or analysis that suggests this property is contributing; and likewise, the Hollywood Historical Society does not have documentation or records that would suggest the existing structure is of historical significance.

## REQUEST

The Applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition for an existing one-story single-family home and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for an approximate 8,000 square foot two-story single-family home. The Feasibility cost analysis provided by the Applicant concludes that the cost to bring the existing home into compliance with contemporary code requirements and living standards is substantial; and, when compared to the cost of new construction, is not economically prudent. Therefore, the Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home and construct a new home that is compliant with all regulations. Staff does not find the existing home to be an exemplary case of design reflective of the original period of construction.

The Applicant proposes a two-story, contemporary style home with nuanced Anglo-Caribbean design influence. The design of the home facilitates a primary focus on the front entrance, and emphasizes the utilization of outdoor space oriented around the waterfront while still maintaining privacy for the residents of the home and respecting spatial separation from adjacent properties. Visual hierarchy is established through the use of variation in massing accented by dramatic windows and pitched roofs. The materiality introduces an element of simplicity into the design without resulting in a bland product, which provides a neutral canvas for the landscaping to further frame the geometry of the home. The new home consists of five bedrooms, including a large master suite, seven bathrooms, and an open living area that connects to a prominent outdoor patio and pool deck. The home is designed with clear intention to provide focused outdoor living, maximizing the natural benefits of the prime location.

The Historic Preservation Board is guided by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the City of Hollywood's Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. These documents offer design controls for materials, scale, massing and location for all properties within the District. The proposed home is consistent with the character of the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District and the design maintains the spatial relationship with surrounding properties in its scale and massing.

## SITE BACKGROUND

<b>Applicant/Owner:</b>	1001 S Southlake LLC / Kimberly Jones
<b>Address/Location:</b>	1001 S Southlake Drive
<b>Size of Property:</b>	23,396 sq. ft. (0.54 acres)
<b>Present Zoning:</b>	Single-Family Residential (RS-9) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
<b>Present Land Use:</b>	Low Residential (LRES)
<b>Present Use of Land:</b>	Single Family
<b>Year Built:</b>	1950 (Permit History)

## ADJACENT ZONING

<b>North:</b>	Government Use (GU) Southlake
<b>South:</b>	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
<b>East:</b>	Single-Family Residential District (RS-9) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)

**West:** Single-Family Residential District (RS-9)  
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)

### **CONSISTENCY WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN**

Within the Comprehensive Plan, the primary goal of the Land Use Element is to *promote a distribution of land uses that will enhance and improve the residential, business, resort and natural communities while allowing the land owners to maximize the use of their property.*

The proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood; while allowing the Applicant to maximize the living area of their property. By allowing the Applicant to construct the proposed home, the City is accomplishing the desired reinvestment in the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

### **CONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN**

The City-Wide Master Plan (CWMP) places a priority on protecting, preserving and enhancing residential neighborhoods. It addresses the need for strict design controls to maintain the individual character of each neighborhood. The proposed home is sensitive to the character of the Historic Lakes Section through its design which possess similar characteristics to existing structures in the surrounding neighborhood.

***Policy 2.46:*** *Preserve stable neighborhoods and encourage rehabilitation initiatives that will revitalize and promote stability of neighborhoods.*

***Policy CW.15:*** *Place a priority on protecting, preserving and enhancing residential neighborhoods.*

The CWMP also states *the single-family character of the area should be preserved and enhanced through strict zoning code enforcement, traffic calming and streetscape improvements.* The project has minimal impact on the current streetscape.

### **CONSISTENCY WITH THE HOLLYWOOD LAKES NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN**

The Hollywood Lakes Neighborhood Plan seeks to maintain and preserve the character and integrity of the existing residential community by protecting historical areas. It also seeks to eliminate the encroachment of negative residential uses.

Although, the existing one-story home was constructed in 195- it does not, on its own, have any historic significance. Stylistically, it is an example of a style of architecture that is found proliferated across the city and region. It is not a style that is unique to the Lakes Historic District. Therefore, the proposal for the redevelopment of the site with a single family home will not adversely affect the integrity of the Historic District.

### **APPLICABLE CRITERIA**

**Decisions on Certificates of Appropriateness for Demolition.** Based on the following criteria and other appropriate considerations, the Board must determine if the building is of historic significance. The Zoning and Land Development Regulations does not provide guidance as to how much weight should be given to each criterion.

**CRITERION 1:** Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

**CRITERION 2:** Association with the lives of persons significant in our past.

**CRITERION 3:** Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.

**CRITERION 4:** Possession of high artistic values.

**CRITERION 5:** Representation of the work of a master.

**CRITERION 6:** Representation of a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

**CRITERION 7:** Yield, or the likelihood of yielding information important in prehistory or history.

**Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition** as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

**CRITERION 1:** The building, structure, improvement, or site is designated on either a national, state, or local level as an historic preservation district or an architectural landmark or site.

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic District Design Guidelines recommend *identifying, retaining and preserving buildings which are important in defining the overall historic character of a historic district or neighborhood*. Although the existing home was constructed in 1950, the Applicant and Staff find no historical merit in their study of the property.

**CRITERION 2:** The building, structure, improvement, or site is of such design, craftsmanship, or material that it could be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.

**ANALYSIS:** Presently, there is no portion of the structure or design element on the home or site that could not be reproduced or replicated without great difficulty or expense.

**CRITERION 3:** The building, structure, improvement, or site is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the county, or the region.

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic District Design Guidelines allow for the removal of *non-significant buildings, additions, or site features which detract from the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood*. As previously stated, although the existing one-story home was constructed in 1950, it does not possess distinct historic architectural features as an individual building, and it is not an exemplar of a specific Period of Significance as indicated by the Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts.

**CRITERION 4:** The building, structure, improvement, or site contributes significantly to the historic character of a historically designated district.

**ANALYSIS:** Staff finds there is not substantial historic character that could be considered to significantly contribute to the character of the district.

**CRITERION 5:** Retention of the building, structure, improvement, or site promotes the general welfare of the city by providing an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, and design or by developing an understanding of the importance and value of a particular culture and heritage.

**ANALYSIS:** As stated hereinabove, the existing home does not embody a structure steeped in architectural style or historical character that would provide an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, or design. Should the Board approve the demolition, it may request that the Hollywood Historical Society, or the owner, at the owner's expense, document and record the existing home for archival records. Such documentation may include measured drawings and high-definition photography.

**CRITERION 6:** There are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and those plans will adversely effect on the historic character of the Historic District.

**ANALYSIS:** The Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home and construct a new home that will meet all applicable code requirements

**CRITERION 7:** The Unsafe Structures Board has ordered the demolition of a structure or the feasibility study determines that the retention of the building would deny the owner of all economically viable uses of the property.

**ANALYSIS:** The Unsafe Structures Board has not ordered the demolition of this home. However, necessary improvements to bring the dated structure into compliance contemporary codes and living standards will be costly and economically imprudent given that the existing structure does not contribute to the district.

**CRITERION 8:** The information listed in the Historic Properties Database (a listing of historic and non-historic properties) has been considered as a guideline in determining whether a Certification of Appropriateness for Demolition should be issued.

**ANALYSIS:** The existing home is not individually designated and has not been evaluated as being a significant contributor to the district.

**Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness of Design** as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

**CRITERION:** INTEGRITY OF LOCATION

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings*. The intent of the Applicant is to design a livable space by replacing the existing structure that maximizes the natural benefit of the location while complying with regulations including setbacks and lot coverage.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** DESIGN

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic District Design Guidelines encourages new construction to be compatible with the character of the neighborhood with regard to scale, materials, texture, and color. The design element of scale relates to the size of the building components or spaces relative to the human body as well as to the larger context relative to the surrounding buildings, streetscape and environment. The proposed design aims to deliver a cohesive architectural style. The Applicant is proposing a design that is contemporary with Anglo-Caribbean nuances, which is a style appropriate for the region. The Applicant has worked with Staff to ensure that the design is not compromised by the requirements of the City's regulations.

**FINDING:** Consistent

**CRITERION:** SETTING

**ANALYSIS:** As stated in the Design Guidelines, "...setting is the relationship of buildings within the Historic District and the surrounding site and neighborhood." The new home as proposed demonstrates the compatibility between historic, coastal regional, and contemporary design. The proposed home seamlessly fits within the Lakes Historic District and the context of the surrounding homes.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** MATERIALS

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines state materials are an important part of the fabric of any historic district or property and help to maintain the historic character of the place. Furthermore, materials are compatible in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to those that are in the historic district should be used. The design of the proposed home utilizes a neutral palette with simplified design elements and cohesive materials that is appropriate for the style aimed to be achieved. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will enhance the ambience achieved by the home's design, allowing for shade, visibility, and framing of the property.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** WORKMANSHIP

**ANALYSIS:** The proposed design is consistent with current workmanship styles and methods and does not imitate or copy any existing style or period while complying with all regulations and it fits within the neighborhood's character.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** ASSOCIATION

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings...* Within the context of historic preservation, elements of design such as massing, scale and rhythm reflect architectural style as well as the richness of the historic district. Meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

#### **ATTACHMENTS**

ATTACHMENT A: Application Package  
ATTACHMENT B: Aerial Photograph