

**CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA  
DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES  
DIVISION OF PLANNING AND URBAN DESIGN**

**DATE:** January 9, 2023 **FILE:** 22-CM-29

**TO:** Historic Preservation Board

**VIA:** Andria Wingett, Assistant Director of Development Services and Planning Manager

**FROM:** Tasheema Lewis, Associate Planner

**SUBJECT:** Djazir and Brigitte Abella request a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a single-family home located at 1621 Jefferson Street, within the Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1) (Abella Residence).

**APPLICANT'S REQUEST**

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a single-family home located within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District

**STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Determination of Historic Status: To be determined by the Historic Preservation Board, based on 5.5.D.3.b. criteria.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition: Based on the determination of Historic Status, the following shall apply:

- a. If the Board determines the status of the property is Non-Historic, no further action is required and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition shall be issued.
- b. If the Board determines that the status of the property is Historic, a recommendation by the Board, based on 5.5.F.4.e. Criteria, shall be forwarded to the City Commission.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: If Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition is approved.

## BACKGROUND

The original one-story home proposed to be demolished was constructed in 1950 (Broward County Property Appraiser's) on an approximately 0.19 acre lot located at 1621 Jefferson Street. The existing structure exhibits some Post War Modern Ranch Style architectural characteristics. Ranch homes were erected in mass to house a wave of new residents. This style popular with builders, were relatively inexpensive and used simple materials with none of the traditional detailing. Archival history does not indicate an Architect of Significance as listed in the district guidelines, nor was there available information with the Hollywood Historical Society.

## REQUEST

The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design to an existing single-family home. The proposed home is a contemporary architectural style using architectural features such as flat roofs, horizontal features, exposed concrete blocks, and extended glass areas. The design of the proposed home utilizes an Earth palette with simplified design elements and materials such as stucco, wood, and exposed concrete. The proposed landscaping further enhances the ambience achieved by the home's design, allowing for shade, visibility, and framing of the property. The home also includes a pool and pool deck. Parking is primarily provided through concrete driveways from the front and rear (alley) of the property.

The Applicant has worked with Staff to ensure that the design is not compromised by the requirements of the City's regulations. The new home meets all applicable requirements including setbacks, height and exceeds the minimum open space requirement.

The Historic Preservation Board is guided by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the City of Hollywood's Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. These documents offer design controls for materials, scale, massing and location for all properties within the District. The proposed home is consistent with the character of the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

## SITE BACKGROUND

<b>Applicant/Owner:</b>	Djazir and Brigitte Abella
<b>Address/Location:</b>	1621 Jefferson Street
<b>Size of Property:</b>	8,182 sq.ft. (0.19 acres)
<b>Present Zoning:</b>	Single-Family Residential (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
<b>Present Land Use:</b>	Low (5) Residential (LRES)
<b>Present Use of Land:</b>	Single Family
<b>Year Built:</b>	1950 (Broward County Property Appraiser)

## ADJACENT ZONING

<b>North:</b>	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
<b>South:</b>	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
<b>East:</b>	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
<b>West:</b>	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)

## CONSISTENCY WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

Within the Comprehensive Plan, the primary goal of the Land Use Element is to *promote a distribution of land uses that will enhance and improve the residential, business, resort and natural communities while allowing the land owners to maximize the use of their property.*

The proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood; while allowing the Applicant to maximize the living area of their property. By allowing the Applicant to construct the proposed home, the City is accomplishing the desired reinvestment in the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

## CONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN

The City-Wide Master Plan (CWMP) places a priority on protecting, preserving and enhancing residential neighborhoods. It addresses the need for strict design controls to maintain the individual character of each neighborhood. The proposed home is sensitive to the character of the Historic Lakes Section through its design which possess similar characteristics to existing structures in the surrounding neighborhood.

***Policy 2.46:*** *Preserve stable neighborhoods and encourage rehabilitation initiatives that will revitalize and promote stability of neighborhoods.*

***Policy CW.15:*** *Place a priority on protecting, preserving, and enhancing residential neighborhoods.*

The CWMP also states *the single-family character of the area should be preserved and enhanced through strict zoning code enforcement, traffic calming and streetscape improvements.* The project has minimal impact on the current streetscape while enhancing the landscaping.

## CONSISTENCY WITH THE HOLLYWOOD LAKES NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN

The Hollywood Lakes Neighborhood Plan seeks to maintain and preserve the character and integrity of the existing residential community by protecting historical areas. It also seeks to eliminate the encroachment of negative residential uses.

The existing home was not constructed during a recognized period of significance and is not exemplary of any particular style.

## APPLICABLE CRITERIA

**Decisions on Certificates of Appropriateness for Demolition.** Based on the following criteria and other appropriate considerations, the Board must determine if the building is of historic significance. The Zoning and Land Development Regulations does not provide guidance as to how much weight should be given to each criterion. Historic status shall be determined by the Board finding that the structure meets at least one of the review criteria for Historic Designation below:

**CRITERION 1:** Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

**CRITERION 2:** Association with the lives of persons significant in our past.

**CRITERION 3:** Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.

**CRITERION 4:** Possession of high artistic values.

**CRITERION 5:** Representation of the work of a master.

**CRITERION 6:** Representation of a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

**CRITERION 7:** Yield, or the likelihood of yielding information important in prehistory or history.

**Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition,** as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5. Should the Board determine the status of the property is non-Historic, no further action is required, and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition shall be issued. If the Board determines that the status of the property is Historic, a recommendation by the Board shall be forwarded to the City Commission. The Board's recommendation shall be based upon the evaluation criteria below:

**CRITERION 1:** The building, structure, improvement, or site is designated on either a national, state, or local level as an historic preservation district or an architectural landmark or site.

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic District Design Guidelines recommend *identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings which are important in defining the overall historic character of a historic district or neighborhood*. The existing home was constructed in 1950, and the Applicant finds no historical merit in their study of the property.

**CRITERION 2:** The building, structure, improvement, or site is of such design, craftsmanship, or material that it could be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.

**ANALYSIS:** While the material of the home is relatively inexpensive and used simple materials with modern detailing, any renovations to the home would require significant modifications to the existing structure, rendering it non-feasible, as it would result in great difficulty and expense for a structure that does not exemplify any specific craftsmanship or detailing.

**CRITERION 3:** The building, structure, improvement, or site is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the county, or the region.

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic District Design Guidelines allow for the removal of *non-significant buildings, additions, or site features which detract from the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood*. As previously stated, the existing one-story home was constructed in 1950 and exhibits some Post War Modern Contemporary Style architectural characteristics. Contemporary homes were erected in mass to house a wave of new residents, as indicated by the Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. Therefore, examples of this kind of architecture are plentiful in the neighborhood.

**CRITERION 4:** The building, structure, improvement, or site contributes significantly to the historic character of a historically designated district.

**ANALYSIS:** Staff finds there is not substantial historic character that could be considered to significantly contribute to the character of the district.

**CRITERION 5:** Retention of the building, structure, improvement, or site promotes the general welfare of the city by providing an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, and design or by developing an understanding of the importance and value of a particular culture and heritage.

**ANALYSIS:** As stated above, the existing home does not embody a structure steeped in architectural style or historical character that would provide an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, or design. Should the Board approve the demolition, it may request that the Hollywood Historical Society, or the owner, at the owner's expense, document and record the existing home for archival records. Such documentation may include measured drawings and high-definition photography.

**CRITERION 6:** There are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and those plans will adversely effect on the historic character of the Historic District.

**ANALYSIS:** The Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home and construct a new home, meeting all applicable code requirements. The proposed home is modern and functional, allowing the Applicant to maximize the use of their property. The design is enhanced by a formal landscape plan which includes an array of native species. As such, the proposed redevelopment of the property, if the demolition is approved, will improve the character of the area.

**CRITERION 7:** The Unsafe Structures Board has ordered the demolition of a structure or the feasibility study determines that the retention of the building would deny the owner of all economically viable uses of the property.

**ANALYSIS:** The Unsafe Structures Board has not ordered the demolition of this home. However, improvements, such as increasing the finished floor elevation to meet FEMA's regulatory heights, impede the owner's ability to move forward with design in manner that is financial feasible or sound. The reinvestment in the property without the freedom of

design for a property that individually significant would be an undue burden for the Applicant. Therefore, the Applicant purports that restoring the existing home is not a feasible option and is proposing a new home to enhance the property in a manner consistent with the goals of the district.

**CRITERION 8:** The information listed in the Historic Properties Database (a listing of historic and non-historic properties) has been considered as a guideline in determining whether a Certification of Appropriateness for Demolition should be issued.

**ANALYSIS:** The Applicant states in their Criteria Statement that a determination the home has no historic merit based on their research. It is not individually designated, and a Master Site File is not available for the existing structure.

**Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness of Design** as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

**CRITERION:** INTEGRITY OF LOCATION

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings*. The intent of the Applicant is to design a livable space by replacing the non-conforming structure that addresses climatic conditions, while complying with regulations. The proposed construction complies with required setbacks and site coverage and does not adversely affect the character of the neighborhood.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** DESIGN

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic District Design Guidelines encourages new construction to be compatible with the character of the neighborhood with regard to scale, materials, texture, and color. The design element of scale relates to the size of the building components or spaces relative to the human body as well as to the larger context relative to the surrounding buildings, streetscape, and environment. The proposed design help to enhance the design in the same architectural style. The Applicant has worked with Staff to ensure that the design is not compromised by the requirements of the City's regulations.

**FINDING:** Consistent

**CRITERION:** SETTING

**ANALYSIS:** As stated in the Design Guidelines, "...setting is the relationship of buildings within the Historic District and the surrounding site and neighborhood." The home as proposed demonstrates the compatibility with the neighborhood and does not disrupt the relationship. Typical of residences in this neighborhood.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** MATERIALS

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines state materials are an important part of the fabric of any historic district or property and help to maintain the historic character of the place. The proposed materials are compatible and consistent in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to other contemporary homes in the historic district using architectural features such as flat roofs, exposed concrete blocks, steel claddings, and extended glass areas.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** WORKMANSHIP

**ANALYSIS:** The proposed design is consistent with current workmanship styles and methods and does not imitate or copy any existing style or period while complying with all regulations and it fits within the neighborhood's character. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will enhance the ambience achieved by the home's design, allowing for shade, visibility, and framing of the property.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** ASSOCIATION

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings... Within the context of historic preservation, elements of design such as massing, scale and rhythm reflect architectural style as well as the richness of the historic district*. Meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood. This project enhances the streetscape elements of the existing residence and the neighbors. Required parking is accommodated by the driveways. As such, the proposed redevelopment of the property, if the demolition is approved, will maintain and improve the character of the area.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

## **ATTACHMENTS**

ATTACHMENT A: Application Package

ATTACHMENT B: Aerial Photograph