

**CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA  
DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES  
DIVISION OF PLANNING AND URBAN DESIGN**

**DATE:** January 09, 2023 **FILE:** 22-CM-43

**TO:** Historic Preservation Board

**VIA:** Andria Wingett, Assistant Director

**FROM:** Mawusi Watson, Planning Administrator

**SUBJECT:** Emile Mimran requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design to build a new single-family home located at 1108 South Northlake Drive, within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

**APPLICANT'S REQUEST**

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a single-family home located at 1108 South Northlake Drive, within the Lakes Area Historic Resource Listing District.

**STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition: To be determined by the Historic Preservation Board.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: Approval, if Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition is granted.

**BACKGROUND**

The subject property is located at 1108 South Northlake Drive and contains an existing one-story home, approximately 4,011 square feet in floor area, that was constructed in 1967 (based on the Broward County Property Appraiser records). The lot is surrounded by the intracoastal to the north (Northlake) and single family residences to the east, west and south. The main and only entrance to this lot is fronting South Northlake Drive.

The proposed new house aims to introduce a more functional layout by increasing the livable space while maintaining a streamlined design focused on transitions between indoor and outdoor spaces.

## REQUEST

The Applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition of the existing one-story single-family home and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for an approximately 11,500 square feet new single-family home. The feasibility study provided by the Applicant states that the original existing house is currently below the top of the seawall and also below flood elevation. Per the Applicant's report, an additional wing appears to have been constructed at a higher level to comply with the flood elevation requirements at that time.

Additionally, the observation report submitted by Arbab Engineering, Inc., dated June 27, 2022 made the following findings with respect to the existing residence:

- Windows and doors are deteriorated and cannot be verified for wind resistance capacity;
- Major structural concrete restoration is required to repair damaged columns;
- Wood roof members are sagging along the ridge;
- Electrical wirings are loose and causing an unsafe condition;
- Wood frames are in poor condition in several locations.

The Applicant states: *"Renovation of the existing house will require us to demo the roof and exterior walls so that we can build a new foundation and to align the floor level with the sea wall and flood elevation requirements"*.

The proposed residence sits on a 140' wide lot, generally within the middle of the subject property, and complies with all required setbacks. The new home has a contemporary style. It will be a two-story home with common areas on the first level, including kitchen, dining and living room areas, as well as a games room and guest bedroom / bathroom. The ground floor living space connects to an outdoor patio and the rear yard, which incorporates a proposed swimming pool flanked by green space on each side extending to the frontage to Northlake. The second floor has five bedrooms, an office, and bedrooms and five bathrooms.

Required parking for the home will be provided via a circular driveway and garage on the west side of the subject property, accessed from South Northlake Drive. The new home meets all applicable requirements including setbacks, height, and approximately 60% green areas.

The proposed materials are compatible and consistent in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to other homes in the historic district. The design utilizes a neutral palette of wood, tiled and painted concrete. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will enhance the ambience achieved by the home's design, allowing for shade, visibility and framing of the property.

The Historic Preservation Board is guided by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the City of Hollywood's Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. These documents offer design controls for materials, scale, massing, and location for all properties within the district. The proposed home is consistent with the character of the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District and the design maintains the spatial relationship with surrounding properties in its scale and massing.

## SITE BACKGROUND

<b>Applicant/Owner:</b>	Emile Mimran
<b>Address/Location:</b>	1108 South Northlake Drive, Hollywood, Florida, 33019
<b>Size of Property:</b>	32,508 sq. ft. (0.75 acres)
<b>Present Zoning:</b>	Single-Family Residential (RS-9) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
<b>Present Land Use:</b>	Low (5) Residential (LRES)
<b>Present Use of Land:</b>	Single Family
<b>Year Built:</b>	1967 (BCPA)

## ADJACENT ZONING

<b>North:</b>	Government Use (GU)
<b>South:</b>	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
<b>East:</b>	Single-Family Residential District (RS-9) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
<b>West:</b>	Single-Family Residential District (RS-9) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)

## CONSISTENCY WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

Within the Comprehensive Plan, the primary goal of the Land Use Element is to *promote a distribution of land uses that will enhance and improve the residential, business, resort and natural communities while allowing the land owners to maximize the use of their property.*

The proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood, while allowing the Applicant to maximize the living area of their property. By allowing the Applicant to construct a new house, the City is accomplishing the desired reinvestment in the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

## CONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN

The City-Wide Master Plan (CWMP) places a priority on protecting, preserving and enhancing residential neighborhoods. It addresses the need for strict design controls to maintain the individual character of each neighborhood. The proposed new house and improvements are sensitive to the character of the Historic Lakes Section through its design which possess similar characteristics to existing structures in the surrounding neighborhood.

***Policy 2.46:*** *Preserve stable neighborhoods and encourage rehabilitation initiatives that will revitalize and promote stability of neighborhoods.*

***Policy CW.15:*** *Place a priority on protecting, preserving, and enhancing residential neighborhoods.*

The CWMP also states *the single-family character of the area should be preserved and enhanced through strict zoning code enforcement, traffic calming and streetscape improvements.* The project has minimal impact on the current streetscape.

## CONSISTENCY WITH THE HOLLYWOOD LAKES NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN

The Hollywood Lakes Neighborhood Plan seeks to maintain and preserve the character and integrity of the existing residential community by protecting historical areas. It also seeks to eliminate the encroachment of negative residential uses.

The existing two-story home was constructed in 1994. It is a Mediterranean style, and it does not represent any period of significance architectural style described in the Design Guidelines. The proposed new two-story house is consistent with the architectural features described in the Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts and enforced by the Historic Preservation Board. Therefore, it will not adversely affect the integrity of the Historic District.

## APPLICABLE CRITERIA

**Decisions on Certificates of Appropriateness for Demolition.** Based on the following criteria and other appropriate considerations, the Board must determine if the building is of historic significance. The Zoning and Land Development Regulations does not provide guidance as to how much weight should be given to each criterion as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

**CRITERION 1:** Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

**CRITERION 2:** Association with the lives of persons significant in our past.

**CRITERION 3:** Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.

**CRITERION 4:** Possession of high artistic values.

**CRITERION 5:** Representation of the work of a master.

**CRITERION 6:** Representation of a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

**CRITERION 7:** Yield, or the likelihood of yielding information important in prehistory or history.

**Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition** as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

**CRITERION 1:** The building, structure, improvement, or site is designated on either a national, state, or local level as an historic preservation district or an architectural landmark or site.

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic District Design Guidelines recommend *identifying, retaining and preserving buildings which are important in defining the overall historic character of a historic district or neighborhood*. The existing house was built in 1967 and the Applicant has not indicated any historical merit in their study of the property.

**CRITERION 2:** The building, structure, improvement, or site is of such design, craftsmanship, or material that it could be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.

**ANALYSIS:** The Applicant desires to increase the size of the existing house that would require a major renovation to the existing structure and will have challenges to overcome due to existing structural conditions and requirements to meet required base flood elevation regulations. This will be non-feasible, as it will result in a great difficulty and expense for a structure that does not exemplify any specific craftsmanship or detailing.

**CRITERION 3:** The building, structure, improvement, or site is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the county, or the region.

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic District Design Guidelines allow for the removal of *non-significant buildings, additions, or site features which detract from the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood*. As previously stated, the existing two-story home was constructed in 1967 and does not exhibit any significant architectural style as indicated by the Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts.

**CRITERION 4:** The building, structure, improvement, or site contributes significantly to the historic character of a historically designated district.

**ANALYSIS:** Staff finds there is not substantial historic character that could be considered to significantly contribute to the character of the district.

**CRITERION 5:** Retention of the building, structure, improvement, or site promotes the general welfare of the city by providing an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, and design or by developing an understanding of the importance and value of a particular culture and heritage.

**ANALYSIS:** As stated hereinabove, the existing home does not embody a structure steeped in architectural style or historical character that would provide an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, or design. Should the Board approve the demolition, it may request that the Hollywood Historical Society, or the owner, at the owner's expense, document and record the existing home for archival records. Such documentation may include measured drawings and high-definition photography.

**CRITERION 6:** There are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and those plans will adversely effect on the historic character of the Historic District.

**ANALYSIS:** The Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home and construct a new home. Meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the surrounding area. The proposed home is contemporary and functional, allowing the Applicant to maximize the use of their property. The design is enhanced by a formal landscape plan which includes an array of native species. Required parking is accommodated on the west side of the property, with limited visibility from the public right of way. As such, the proposed redevelopment of the property, if the demolition is approved, will improve the character of the area.

**CRITERION 7:** The Unsafe Structures Board has ordered the demolition of a structure, or the feasibility study determines that the retention of the building would deny the owner of all economically viable uses of the property.

**ANALYSIS:** The Unsafe Structures Board has not ordered the demolition of this home. However, significant improvements, including demolition and restoration of deteriorated components and increasing the finished floor elevation to meet FEMA's regulatory heights, impede the owner's ability to move forward with a design in a manner that is financially feasible or sound. The reinvestment in the property without the freedom of design for a property that does not represent a Period of Significance or possess historic merit would be an undue burden for the Applicant. Therefore, the Applicant purports that restoring the existing home is not a feasible option and is proposing a new home to enhance the structure and property in a manner consistent with the goals of the district.

**CRITERION 8:** The information listed in the Historic Properties Database (a listing of historic and non-historic properties) has been considered as a guideline in determining whether a Certification of Appropriateness for Demolition should be issued.

**ANALYSIS:** The Applicant has not identified any historic merit to the existing residences in their application. The property is not individually designated, and a Master Site File is not available for the existing structure.

**Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness of Design** as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

**CRITERION:** INTEGRITY OF LOCATION

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings*. The intent of the Applicant is to design a livable space by replacing the existing structure with a new residence that maximizes the natural benefit of the location while complying with regulations including setbacks and lot coverage.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** DESIGN

**ANALYSIS:** The Historic District Design Guidelines encourages new construction to be compatible with the character of the neighborhood regarding scale, materials, texture, and color. The design element of scale relates to the size of the building components or spaces relative to the human body as well as to the larger context relative to the surrounding buildings, streetscape, and environment. The proposed design aims to deliver a cohesive architectural style. The Applicant is proposing a design that is contemporary and offers a cohesive and well-defined architectural style.

**FINDING:** Consistent

**CRITERION:** SETTING

**ANALYSIS:** As stated in the Design Guidelines, “...*setting is the relationship of buildings within the Historic District and the surrounding site and neighborhood.*” The proposed development demonstrates compatibility with the neighborhood and does not disrupt the relationship to other buildings within the Lakes Historic District.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** MATERIALS

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines state materials are an important part of the fabric of any historic district or property and help to maintain the historic character of the place. Furthermore, materials are compatible in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to those that are in the historic district should be used. The design of the proposed improvements utilizes a neutral palette with simplified design elements such as stucco, tile, glass and wood. The proposed request is consistent with other contemporary home designs within the district. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will enhance the design, allowing shade, visibility and framing of the property.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** WORKMANSHIP

**ANALYSIS:** The Design Guidelines recommend consideration of significant materials before undergoing rehabilitation of a historic structure or property. Materials of the addition are sensitive in design and nature to the home and adjacent properties. The design of the new single-family home is consistent with current workmanship styles and methods in the area.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

**CRITERION:** ASSOCIATION

**ANALYSIS:** Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings... Within the context of historic preservation, elements of design such as massing, scale and rhythm reflect architectural style as well as the richness of the historic district.* Meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood.

**FINDING:** Consistent.

## **ATTACHMENTS**

ATTACHMENT A: Application Package

ATTACHMENT B: Aerial Photograph