

**INITIAL EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEETING
RFQ-4421-14-RD**

CONTINUING CONTRACT FOR STRUCTURAL ENGINEERING SERVICES (PW-14-009)

JUNE 12, 2014 ENGINEERING CONFERENCE ROOM, ROOM 308

Attendees: Terrence Comiskey - Public Works/Engineering
Les Petit - Public Utilities/ESSD
Bob Wertz - Public Utilities/ESSD
Walter Wernecke - Public Works/Architecture
Frank Leon — Public Works/Engineering

Proposers: Duran Consulting Engineering
Lakdas/Yohalem Engineering, Inc.
Pistorino & Alam Consulting Engineers, Inc.
BCC Engineering, Inc.
Douglas Wood Associates, Inc.
Walker Parking Consultants
TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.
Derose Design Consultants
Billerreinhardt Structural Group, Inc.
Sanalil Construction
American Engineering Design

The initial evaluation meeting convened at 2:00 p.m. and adjourned at 3:00 p.m.

Procurement Services informed the evaluation committee that the RFQ submittals received from Sanalil Construction and American Engineering Design had been declared non-responsive as they were submitted incomplete.

The Evaluation Committee consisting of five (5) City employees met to review, discuss and evaluate the nine (9) responsive proposals received for a qualified engineering firm to provide a Continuing Contract for Structural Engineering Services (PW-14-009) for Public Works/Engineering based upon the RFQ's purpose, scope, system requirements and initial evaluation criteria.

The RFQ document's Consultant Selection Process requires an initial evaluation committee to review and score/rank the responsive proposals based upon the Initial Selection Criteria by which a minimum of three (3) firms will be shortlisted for oral interviews.

After review, discussion and evaluation of the nine (9) responsive RFQ submittals received, the Evaluation Committee unanimously recommended the following:

The evaluation committee scored and ranked the nine (9) responsive RFQ submittals with the five (5) highest ranked proposers being shortlisted as follows. (Matrix attached).

1. Lakdas/Yohalem Engineering, Inc.
2. TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.
3. DeRose Design Consultants
4. Walker Parking Consultants
5. BCC Engineering, Inc.

INITIAL EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEETING RFQ-4421-14-RD (Page 2)

Agreed that the RFQ submittals received from Lakdas/Yohalem Engineering, Inc., BCC Engineering, Inc., Walker Parking Consultants, TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc. and Derosé Design Consultants would best meet the City's operational needs.

Agreed that the RFQ submittals received from Duran Consulting Engineering, Pistorino & Alam Consulting Engineers, Inc., Douglas Wood Associates, Inc. and Billerreinhardt Structural Group, Inc. lacked some required detailed and clear information to meet the City's operational needs.

Agreed that they would like to have oral presentations scheduled from the five (5) highest ranked proposers who were shortlisted to further evaluate their RFP submittals as specified in the RFQ document.

Procurement Services will notify the five (5) highest ranked responsive proposers and the evaluation committee members to schedule the date, time and location for the oral presentations.

The meeting was facilitated by Ralph Dierks from Procurement Services.

Note: Recording device malfunctioned and was not utilized.

**ORAL PRESENTATION EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEETING
RFQ-4421-14-RD**

CONTINUING CONTRACT FOR STRUCTURAL ENGINEERING SERVICES (PW-14-009)

JUNE 27, 2014 PARKING OFFICE CONFERENCE ROOM, ANNEX 2ND FLOOR

Attendees: Terrence Comiskey - Public Works/Engineering
Les Petit - Public Utilities/ESSD
Bob Wertz - Public Utilities/ESSD
Walter Wernecke - Public Works/Architectural
Frank Leon -- Public Works/Engineering

Proposers: Derose Design Consultants - 9:00 A.M.
TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc. – 9:45 A.M.
BCC Engineering, Inc. – 10:30 A.M.
Lakdas/Yohalem Engineering, Inc. - 11:15 A.M.
Walker Parking Consultants – 12:00 P.M.

The oral presentation evaluation meeting convened at 9:10 A.M. and adjourned at 12:50 p.m.

The Evaluation Committee consisting of five (5) City employees met to listen to oral presentations and review and discuss the five (5) shortlisted proposals received for a qualified vendor to provide Structural Engineering Services based upon the RFQ's purpose, scope of services and the oral presentation evaluation criteria.

- Each presenter was allowed twenty (20) minutes to make their presentation followed by a ten (10) minute question and answer period.

The evaluation of the oral presentations was based upon the following criteria as established in the RFQ: Knowledge of sites and local conditions, Proposed project staff functions, Overall approach and methodology, Design philosophy and concepts, Cost control and value engineering and Schedule for projects.

The oral presentations were evaluated and the scores were compiled to arrive at the following rankings, (highest score), first choice to fifth choice (matrix attached):

1.	Lakdas/Yohalem Engineering, Inc.	454
2.	DeRose Design Consultants	441
3.	TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.	440
4.	BCC Engineering, Inc.	402
5.	Walker Parking Consultants	390

**ORAL PRESENTATION EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEETING RFQ-4421-14-RD
(Page 2)**

The combined scores of the initial evaluation and the oral evaluation/presentations by the Evaluation Committee resulted in the following ranking:

1.	Lakdas/Yohalem Engineering, Inc.	879
2.	TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc	863
3.	DeRose Design Consultants	844
4.	BCC Engineering, Inc.	777
5.	Walker Parking Consultants	776

The RFQ document stated that, the Department of Public Works, pursuant to Florida State Statute 287.055, Consultants Competitive Negotiation Act, is seeking to engage the services and enter into a continuing contract with up to three (3) qualified engineering firms to provide mechanical, electrical and plumbing engineering design services on an as needed basis for miscellaneous City projects as authorized by individual Consultant's Authorization to Proceed for individual projects.

The evaluation committee agreed that the RFQ submittals received from Lakdas/Yohalem Engineering, Inc., TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc. and DeRose Design Consultants would best meet the City's operational needs.

The evaluation committee requested that Procurement move forward with the RFP award process by preparing a resolution for the City Commission based upon their recommendation to award contracts to the three (3) highest ranked firms.

Procurement Services will prepare a resolution and will also notify the three (3) highest ranked responsive proposers of the date and time of the City Commission meeting on which the award resolution is scheduled on the agenda.

The meeting was facilitated by Ralph Dierks from Procurement Services.

CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA

PROPOSAL NO.: RFQ-4421-14-RD

ITEM: CONTINUING CONTRACT FOR STRUCTURAL ENGINEERING SERVICES (PW 14-009)

OPENING DATE & TIME: 3:00 P.M., FRIDAY, MAY 30, 2014

PROPOSALS RECEIVED FROM:

[illegible]

EVALUATION MATRIX

RFQ-4421-14-RD Continuing Contract for Structural Engineering Services (PW 14-009)

Proposers: Evaluation Committee Members:	Duran Consulting Engineering	Lakdas / Yohalem Engineering, Inc.	Pistorino & Alam Consulting Engineers, Inc.	BCC Engineering, Inc.	Douglas Wood Associates, Inc.	Walker Parking Consultants	TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.	DeRose Design Consultants	Billerreinhardt Structural Group Inc.
Terrence Comiskey	60	91	65	67	63	79	80	84	58
Frank J. Leon	48	82	73	77	78	82	82	79	70
Leslie Pettit	76	88	71	76	73	78	83	81	76
Bob Wertz	23	77	81	73	73	70	91	77	88
Walter Wernecke	57	87	63	82	73	77	87	82	80
TOTALS	264	425	353	375	360	386	423	403	372
RANKINGS	9	1	8	5	7	4	2	3	6

EVALUATION MATRIX ORAL PRESENTATIONS

RFQ-4421-14-RD Continuing Contract for Structural Engineering Services (PW 14-009)

Proposers: Evaluation Committee Members:	Lakdas / Yohalem Engineering, Inc.	BCC Engineering, Inc.	Walker Parking Consultants	TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.	DeRose Design Consultants
Terrence Comiskey	89	69	70	81	83
Frank J. Leon	88	81	74	85	82
Leslie Pettit	97	85	83	89	86
Bob Wertz	85	82	83	90	90
Walter Wernecke	95	85	80	95	100
TOTALS	454	402	390	440	441
RANKINGS	1	4	5	3	2

PROPOSERS EVALUATIONS COMBINED FINAL SCORE

Lakdas/Yohalem Engineering, Inc.	879
TRC Worldwide Engineering, Inc.	863
DeRose Design Consultants	844
BCC Engineering, Inc.	777
Walker Parking Consultants	776