

**CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA
DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES
DIVISION OF PLANNING AND URBAN DESIGN**

DATE: September 12, 2023 **FILE:** 23-CM-53, 23-CM-54

TO: Historic Preservation Board

VIA: Anand Balram, Planning Manager

FROM: Laura Gomez, Associate Planner

SUBJECT: Tiran Real Estate Enterprise LLC requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition of one single-family home and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for two new single-family homes located at 1313 and 1317 Harrison Street within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

APPLICANT'S REQUEST

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a single-family home located within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition: To be determined by the Historic Preservation Board, based on criteria 5.5.D.3.b. of the Zoning and Land Development Regulations.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: Based on the determination of Historic Status, the following shall apply:

- a. If the Board determines the status of the property is Non-Historic, no further action is required, and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition shall be issued.
- b. If the Board determines that the status of the property is Historic, a recommendation by the Board, based on 5.5.F.4.e. Criteria, shall be forwarded to the City Commission.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: Based on staff determination on provided proposal, the following shall apply:

- a. The Applicant shall improve the architectural design by exploring alternative options that would allow for the sympathetic redevelopment of the property while retaining some of its historical essence, re-Designing the new structures to pay homage to the original design, incorporating original materials into the new design to establish a connection between the past and present.
- b. Correct discrepancies between landscape, civil and architectural set of plans.

- c. Return to the board for approval.
- d. Approved if Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition is granted.
- e. New homes should include commemorative plaques (pedestal or affixed to the new structure), visible from the public realm honoring previous local historical significance of the property and structure.

BACKGROUND

As per the Broward County Appraiser and archival history, the home was constructed in 1925. The existing one-story home proposed to be demolished was constructed on an approximate 18,159 square feet lot located at 1317 Harrison Street and archival history does not reveal the name of the architect that designed the home.

The original plans of the home are representative of Mediterranean Revival/Spanish Eclectic architecture that was prevalent during 1917-1935 and characteristic of Mission Style. The Historic District design guidelines states Mediterranean Revival style is the predominant style of historic properties on Harrison and Tyler Streets in Hollywood. This style is often flamboyant and was a strong influence for Joseph Young in the planning of early Hollywood. Residential examples are more frequently asymmetrical around heavily landscaped patios or courtyards. Scuppers and a row of barrel tile enhancing the flat roof line add to the integrity of the combination of the styles Mission style and Mediterranean Revival of the house. Additional features include a recessed focal window with a segmented arch; porte-cochere; decorative stone and chimney. Portales, (covered, arcaded hallways) may be attached or open on both sides and may function as exterior circulation as well as providing shade, pitch roofs only begin to describe the modern home.

Archival history and building permit search reveal that throughout the years, there have been various renovations to the original design of the home. Documentation provided from the Historic Society Research Center indicates that due to noteworthy events that occurred on the on the property lend it to have historical significance. This building is significant because it dates from the earliest construction period in Hollywood, Florida. Although this building itself is not architecturally significant on an individual basis, its significance in the historic built environment may become greater as the older structures in Hollywood are demolished. The properties at 1317 & 1313 Harrison Street have a rich history of ownership. Edwin R. Closs was the original owner of the property. On April 1, 1932, William T. Rich of Newton, Massachusetts, also known as the "Coffee King," purchased the property. He was introduced to Hollywood through his friendship with W. J. Cozens of W. J. Cozens Realty and had previously wintered for several years at the Royal Palm T-hotel in Miami.

The permit history shows that Melina Tomich, founder of Milena Melina's at 2010 Hollywood Boulevard was another former owner of the property. Elsie Johns, known as "Miss J," holds historic local significance as the owner of Melina's, the oldest continually operated family business on Hollywood Boulevard, Florida. Operating in a building constructed by her father in the late '40s, her store and steadfast presence provide a tangible link to the city's past. Her adaptive approach, maintaining the store's essence while evolving its offerings, showcased her resilience and dedication. As the longest-running member of the

Chamber of Commerce and a committed volunteer, Elsie embodied a living connection to Hollywood's history, reflecting the evolution of the community and preserving its heritage for future generations. Her home holds potential historical significance due to its role as a long-standing residence in Downtown Hollywood, Florida. As the house in which she grew up and lived in until she passed, it possesses a strong connection to the area's history. Her long-standing tenure in the home reflects a continuity of personal and community history. This residence serves as a tangible link to a bygone era in Hollywood's development, offering insights into the architectural styles, living conditions, and daily life of the past. As Downtown Hollywood evolves, Elsie's home stands as a physical representation of the city's historical roots and the endurance of its heritage.

REQUEST

The Applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition of structures located at 1313 and 1317 Harrison Street and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for two two-story single-family homes at the currently subdivided parcel located on the lots 10, 11 and 12. The Feasibility Study provided by the applicant concludes that the residence in its current condition is dangerous and the cost to bring the existing home into compliance *would exceed the cost of a new home*. Therefore, the Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home and construct two new homes that are compliant with FEMA regulations and, therefore, not at risk for future hazard as a result of potential flooding. According to the feasibility analysis it would be *highly inadvisable to rehabilitate the current structure without raising the FFE*.

Additionally, the observation report submitted by Green Costal Engineering Inc., dated January 17, 2023, made the following findings with respect to the existing residence:

Building One

Building one is undermined and requires foundation restoration work to restore foundation surface bearing area. A minor amount of rot was observed in the roof trusses, requiring additional destructive investigation and roof truss replacement as required.

Building Two

Building two is undermined and requires foundation restoration work to restore foundation surface bearing area. Inadequate supports for the interior floor joists were observed, requiring installation of new structure capable of resisting land settlement.

Building Three

Building three and related auxiliary structures are undermined and require foundation restoration work to restore foundation surface bearing area. A minor amount of rot was observed in the second-floor framing, requiring additional destructive investigation and joists replacement as required.

Building Four

The garage area is in good condition. The attached entertainment area floor system is constructed directly on grade without any protective barrier against the elements and should be demolished and replaced with a new structure.

The existing home to be demolished was constructed in 1925 (according to building permit history) archival history shows that this building is not architecturally significance on an individual basis.

Each proposed residence is on a 75-foot-wide lot, generally within the middle of the subject property, and complies with all required setbacks. The new homes have a contemporary style and the new proposed design replicates some of the design features from the original structure. They will be two-story homes with common areas on the first level, including kitchen, dining, and living room areas, as well as a garage, covered terrace, and a pool. The second floor has the bedrooms and bathrooms, and a balcony. Required parking for the homes will be provided via driveway and a two car garages. The driveways are accessed from Harrison Street. The new homes meet all applicable requirements including setbacks, height, and 40% minimum green areas required.

The proposed materials are compatible and consistent in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to other home in the historic district. The design utilized a warm palette of stucco, simulated wood, exposed concrete, and concrete blocks. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will enhance the ambience achieved by the home's design, allowing for shade, visibility and framing of the property and to preserve building three proposed as a Den/office.

The Historic Preservation Board is guided by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the City of Hollywood's Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. These documents offer design controls for materials, scale, massing, and location for all properties within the District. The proposed home is consistent with the character of the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District and the design maintains the spatial relationship with surrounding properties in its scale and massing.

SITE BACKGROUND

Applicant/Owner:	Tiran Real Estate Enterprise LLC
Address/Location:	1313 & 1317 Harrison Street
Size of Property:	18,160 sq. ft. (0.42 acres)
Present Zoning:	Single-Family Residential (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
Present Land Use:	Low Residential (LRES)
Present Use of Land:	Single Family
Year Built:	1925 (Permit History)

ADJACENT ZONING

North:	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
South:	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
East:	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)
West:	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLD-1)

CONSISTENCY WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

Within the Comprehensive Plan, the primary goal of the Land Use Element is to *promote a distribution of land uses that will enhance and improve the residential, business, resort and natural communities while*

allowing the land owners to maximize the use of their property.

The proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood, while allowing the Applicant to maximize the living area of their property. By allowing the Applicant to construct the proposed homes, the City is accomplishing the desired reinvestment in the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN

The City-Wide Master Plan (CWMP) places a priority on protecting, preserving, and enhancing residential neighborhoods. It addresses the need for strict design controls to maintain the individual character of each neighborhood.

Policy 2.46: *Preserve stable neighborhoods and encourage rehabilitation initiatives that will revitalize and promote stability of neighborhoods.*

Policy CW.15: *Place a priority on protecting, preserving, and enhancing residential neighborhoods.*

The CWMP also states *the single-family character of the area should be preserved and enhanced through strict zoning code enforcement, traffic calming and streetscape improvements.* The project has minimal impact on the current streetscape while enhancing the landscaping.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE HOLLYWOOD LAKES NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN

The Hollywood Lakes Neighborhood Plan seeks to maintain and preserve the character and integrity of the existing residential community by protecting historical areas. It also seeks to eliminate the encroachment of negative residential uses.

Although, the existing one-story home was constructed in 1951 it does not, on its own, have any historic significance. It is an example of a post war modern ranch home; however, it is not exemplary of the style; and furthermore, there are a number of post war ranch homes proliferated across the city. It is not a style that is unique to the Lakes Historic District. Therefore, the proposal for the redevelopment of the site with a single-family home will not adversely affect the integrity of the Historic District.

APPLICABLE CRITERIA

Decisions on Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition. Based on the following criteria and other appropriate considerations, the Board must determine if the building is of historic significance. The Zoning and Land Development Regulations does not provide guidance as to how much weight should be given to each criterion.

CRITERION 1: Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

CRITERION 2: Association with the lives of persons significant in our past.

CRITERION 3: Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.

CRITERION 4: Possession of high artistic values.

CRITERION 5: Representation of the work of a master.

CRITERION 6: Representation of a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

CRITERION 7: Yield, or the likelihood of yielding information important in prehistory or history.

Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

CRITERION 1: The building, structure, improvement, or site is designated on either a national, state, or local level as an historic preservation district or an architectural landmark or site.

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines recommend *identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings which are important in defining the overall historic character of a historic district or neighborhood.*

CRITERION 2: The building, structure, improvement, or site is of such design, craftsmanship, or material that it could be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.

ANALYSIS: Presently, there is no portion of the structure or design element on the home or site that could not be reproduced or replicated without great difficulty or expense. The Applicant desires to increase the size of the existing house that will require a major renovation to the existing structure and will have challenges to overcome without the ability to meet applicable building code requirements. This will be non-feasible, as it will result in a great difficulty and expense for a structure that does not exemplify any specific craftsmanship or detailing.

CRITERION 3: The building, structure, improvement, or site is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the county, or the region.

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines allow for the removal of *non-significant buildings, additions, or site features which detract from the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood.* Although the existing two-story home was constructed in 1988, it does not possess distinct historic architectural features as an individual building, and it is not an exemplar of a specific Period of Significance as indicated by the Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts.

CRITERION 4: The building, structure, improvement, or site contributes significantly to the historic character of a historically designated district.

ANALYSIS: Staff finds there is not substantial historic character that could be considered to significantly contribute to the character of the district.

CRITERION 5: Retention of the building, structure, improvement, or site promotes the general welfare of the city by providing an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, and design

or by developing an understanding of the importance and value of a particular culture and heritage.

ANALYSIS: As stated hereinabove, the existing home does not embody a structure steeped in architectural style or historical character that would provide an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, or design. That said, the home was inhabited by figures that are locally significant to the City's History. Should the Board approve the demolition, Staff recommend that the new home should include a commemorative plaque (pedestal or affixed to the new structure), visible from the public realm honoring previous local historical significance of the property and structure. The Board may also request that the Hollywood Historical Society, or the owner, at the owner's expense, document and record the existing home for archival records. Such documentation may include measured drawings and high-definition photography.

CRITERION 6: There are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and those plans will adversely effect on the historic character of the Historic District.

ANALYSIS: The Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home and construct a new home. The proposed home is contemporary and functional, allowing the Applicant to maximize the use of their property. The design is enhanced by a formal landscape plan which includes an array of native species. Required parking is accommodated.

CRITERION 7: The Unsafe Structures Board has ordered the demolition of a structure, or the feasibility study determines that the retention of the building would deny the owner of all economically viable uses of the property.

ANALYSIS: The Unsafe Structures Board has not ordered the demolition of this home. However, improvements, such as increasing the finished floor elevation to meet FEMA's regulatory heights, impede the owner's ability to move forward with design in manner that is financially feasible or sound. The reinvestment in the property without the freedom of design for a property that does not represent a Period of Significance or possess historic merit would be an undue burden for the Applicant. Therefore, the Applicant purports that restoring the existing home is not a feasible option and is proposing a new home to enhance the property in a manner consistent with the goals of the district.

CRITERION 8: The information listed in the Historic Properties Database (a listing of historic and non-historic properties) has been considered as a guideline in determining whether a Certification of Appropriateness for Demolition should be issued.

ANALYSIS: The Applicant states in their Criteria Statement that a determination the home has no historic merit based on their research. It is not individually designated, and a Master Site File is not available for the existing structure.

Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness of Design as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

CRITERION: INTEGRITY OF LOCATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines recommend maintaining consistent spacing and setbacks and further state new construction should be compatible with existing buildings. The intent of the Applicant is to design a livable space by replacing the existing structure that maximizes the natural benefit of the location while complying with regulations including setbacks, lot coverage and does not adversely affect the character of the neighborhood.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: DESIGN

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines encourage new construction to be compatible with the character of the neighborhood with regard to scale, materials, texture, and color. The design element of scale relates to the size of the building components or spaces relative to the human body as well as to the larger context relative to the surrounding buildings, streetscape, and environment. The proposed homes design represents this current time in architecture, creating unique and interesting massing on each home.

FINDING: Consistent

CRITERION: SETTING

ANALYSIS: As stated in the Design Guidelines, *"...setting is the relationship of buildings within the Historic District and the surrounding site and neighborhood."* The new homes shall maintain their integrity of location while creating setting and transition in scale from the public realm to the private realm.

FINDING: Inconclusive.

CRITERION: MATERIALS

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines state materials are an important part of the fabric of any historic district or property and help to maintain the historic character of the place. Furthermore, materials are compatible in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to those that are in the historic district should be used. The design of the proposed homes utilizes a neutral palette with simplified design elements and cohesive materials such as stucco, glass, metal, and wood cladding. The proposed request is consistent with other modern home designs within the district. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will enhance the ambience achieved by the home's design, allowing for shade, visibility, and framing of the property.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: WORKMANSHIP

ANALYSIS: The Design Guidelines recommend consideration of significant materials before undergoing rehabilitation of a historic structure or property. Materials of the addition are sensitive in design and nature to the home and adjacent properties. The design of the

new single-family homes is consistent with current workmanship styles and methods in the area.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: ASSOCIATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings...* *Within the context of historic preservation, elements of design such as massing, scale and rhythm reflect architectural style as well as the richness of the historic district.* Meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood.

FINDING: Inconclusive.

ATTACHMENTS

ATTACHMENT A: Application Package for 23-CM-53
ATTACHMENT B: Application Package for 23-CM-54
ATTACHMENT C: Aerial Map