

CITY OF HOLLYWOOD

RFP # 4522-16-RD

AUGUST 4, 2016

SCORING MATRIX

	COMPANY	ASCENSION		YORK		PMA			NARS		CORVEL	
		WC	LIABILITY	WC	LIABILITY	WC	LIABILITY	COMB	WC	LIABILITY	WC	LIABILITY
1	EXPERIENCE (20 POINTS MAX)	13	14	18	18	16	15	16	13	13	16	16
2	TECHNICAL QUALIFICATION OF ORGANIZATION AND ASSIGNED PERSONS (20 POINTS MAX)	13	14	16	18	14	14	14	14	14	14	14
	Loss Control Resources specifically identified?	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
	Detailed Answer provided to explanation on Loss Control Services?	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes But No Capabilities	Yes But No Capabilities
	Carrier Approved?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No			No	Yes	Yes	Yes
3	PROJECT UNDERSTANDING, PROPOSED APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY AND SERVICES PROVIDED (20 POINTS MAX)	10	14	17	18	14	14	16	15	15	16	16
4	REFERENCES AND COMPLETED PROJECTS (10 POINTS MAX)	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	8	10	10	10
	Reference #1	City of Port St. Lucie		Palm Beach Co. School District		Lee County BOCC			Florida Sheriff's Risk Mgmt. Fund		City of Miami Beach	
	Reference #2	Martin Co. BOCC		Florida Insurance Trust		City of Ocala			Fla. Workers Comp. Insurance Guaranty Assoc.		City of North Miami	
	Reference #3	St. Lucie Co. BOCC		City of Lake Worth		Prince William County, Virginia			AAA Cooper Transportation		City of Pompano Beach	
5	COST (30 POINTS MAX)	23	30	25	14	26	17	20	12	20	18	18
	FLAT FEE - ANNUAL	\$ 116,500	\$ 82,500	\$ 114,556	\$ 199,295	\$ 101,750	\$ 170,000	\$ 257,000	\$ 152,500	\$ 140,000	\$ 298,000	
	FLAT FEE - MONTHLY	\$ 9,708	\$ 6,875	\$ 9,547	\$ 16,608	\$ 8,479	\$ 14,167	\$ 21,417	\$ 12,708	\$ 11,667		
	ADJUSTED INITIAL ANNUAL FLAT FEE	\$ 116,500	\$ 82,500	\$ 114,556	\$ 199,295	\$101,750	\$170,000	\$ 257,000	\$ 152,500	\$ 140,000		
	TOTAL ANNUAL CLAIM ADMIN FEES (WC AND LIABILITY)	\$ 199,000		\$ 313,851		\$ 257,000			\$ 292,500		\$ 296,750	
	RUN-IN/TAIL WC INDEMNITY CAP AND MEDICAL CAP and GL CAP	Does not apply - current TPA so no tail claim fees apply		N/A - included in annual fees		Flat annual fee covers tail claims up to 72 indemnity claims, 65 medical only claims, 145 Auto Liab / BI claims, 42 Auto Liab. / Prop. Damage claims, 18 Auto / Physical Damage claims and 15 Prof. Liab. Claims. If additional takeover claims are received, the program will be re-priced			N/A included in annual fee		\$250K covers WC and Liab. Claims handling for all new claims and all WC tail claims. \$250K covers on 55 liability tail claims Additional charge of \$250 per claim for 187 tail liab. claims = \$46,750 + \$250K annual fee = \$296,750 for first year.	
	NEW MEDICAL ONLY CLAIMS OVER CAP					N/A included in annual fees					N/A included in annual fee	
	NEW INDEMNITY CLAIMS OVER CAP											
	INDEMNITY TAIL CLAIMS OVER CAP					Did not provide pricing - stated program will need to be re-priced if tail claims exceed those stated above						
	LIABILITY TAIL CLAIMS OVER CAP	N/A - included in annual fee		N/A - included in annual fees							\$ 250	
	ADDITIONAL FEES:											
	BILL REVIEW/REPRICING	\$1.25 Per Line 3 Line Minimum		\$9.95 Per Bill		\$7.00/Bill			\$7.00/Bill		\$8/Bill	
	HOSPITAL AUDIT	25% of Savings		25% of Savings		25%			25%		25%	
	NETWORK SAVINGS	25% of Savings		25% of Savings		25%			25%		25%	
	SUBROGATION/RECOVERY	10% of Savings				0			0		20%	
	TELEPHONE CASE MANAGEMENT			\$90/HR		\$95/HR			\$95/HR		\$225/Month or \$78/Hr	
	FIELD CASE MANAGEMENT			\$90/HR		\$95/HR			\$95/HR		\$83-\$95/Hr	
	NURSE REVIEW			\$95/HR		\$95/HR			\$95/HR		\$100/Hr	
	Pharmacy Benefits Management	No PBM				No PBM			No PBM			
	Retail Brand			AWP-12%+\$3.75								
	Retail Generic			AWP-24%+\$3.75								
	Mail Order Brand			AWP-14%+\$2.75								
	Mail Order Generic			AWP-28%+\$2.75								
	Annual Acct. Management Fee	Included		Included		Included			Included		\$ 5,000	
	One-time Data Conversion Fee (Tail claims)	N/A - included in annual fee		\$ 7,500		N/A included in annual fees			\$2,500		\$10,000 but Corvel said this is negotiable	
	Life of Contract Pricing?	YES		YES		YES			YES		YES	
	TECHNICAL POINTS SUBTOTAL (100 POINTS MAX)	69	82	86	78	80	70	76	62	72	74	74
	Local Preference (5 bonus points)	4	4	4	4	3	3	3	3	3	3	5
	CONTRACT TERMS	1 year term - Subject to 5% or CPI increase after second year		Claim handling pricing is based on a 3 year agreement with a 3% increase for 2nd and 3rd year		Flat 3 year pricing for annual claims handling of \$257,000 - PMA provided pricing for just WC, just Liability and then a "bundled" price of \$257K for combined			3 Subject to exceed the greater of 3.5% or CPI after 1st year		3 Subject to exceed the greater of 3.5% or CPI after 1st year	

GL Claims

	Closed	Open	Total
2010	150	15	165
2011	190	18	208
2012	125	35	160
2013	87	36	123
2014	72	64	136
5 Year Avg			158.4

WC

	Closed	Open	Total
2009	21	119	140
2010	13	106	119
2011	16	131	147
2012	16	106	122
2013	10	94	104
	76	556	632
	15.2	111.2	126.4

WC CAP	Corvel Cap	Add Charge	PMA CAP	Add Charge	City of Hollywood Actual Open Claims
Indemnity	25	32300	72		59
Med Only	70	0	65	4	69
GL CAP GL	55	102850	287		242
Unit Cost					
WC					
	Indemnity	550			
	MO				
GL		550			

Per RFP (Pg 40 for WC)	Corvel Excess of Cap Charge	Corvel Excess Claim Count	Additional Corvel Charge	PMA Excess of Cap Charge	PMA Excess Claim Count
33	\$ 950		8 \$ 7,600		
117	\$ 150		47 \$ 7,050		52
242	\$ 550	187	\$ 102,850		

Additional
PMA Charge