CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIVISION OF PLANNING AND URBAN DESIGN

DATE: April 9, 2024 **FILE:** 23-CM-102

TO: Historic Preservation Board

VIA: Anand Balram, Planning Manager

FROM: Tasheema Lewis, Associate Planner

SUBJECT: Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a new single-

family home located at 1015 South Southlake Drive, within the Lakes Area Multiple

Resource Listing District (HMPRLOD-1)

APPLICANT'S REQUEST

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a new single-family home located within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition: To be determined by the Historic Preservation Board.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: Approval, if Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition is approved.

BACKGROUND

The existing one-story home was constructed in 1961/1974, according to the Broward County Property Appraiser, and situated on an approximately 0.53-acre lot located at 1015 S. Southlake Drive. The year of construction occurred just outside the 'Historic Period of Significance' called Post War Modern, and the archival history of the history does not indicate that the property is historical in nature. Although the year of construction does not fall within a 'Period of Significance', the existing architectural features of the home demonstrate a Mid-Century Modern feel with the use of the unusual size and oversized windows with an indoor/outdoor feel.

REQUEST

The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design to an existing single-family home. The proposed home facilitates a contemporary architectural style utilizing floor to

ceiling windows, wood elements, stone cladding with an offset pattern to introduce movement and rhythm, and a flat roof with asymmetrical openings. The proposed design gives homage to the Mid-Century Modern Period of the original home by incorporating some of the key features of this period. The design utilizes an earth tones, and a warm color palette and landscaping features that further enhances the ambience achieved by the home's design, allowing for shade, visibility, and framing of the property. The home also includes a pool and pool deck, and a putting green on the second-floor level. Parking is primarily provided through a linear concrete driveway adjacent to a two-car garage. The applicant is not seeking any variances. The proposed home meets all applicable requirements including setbacks, height and exceeds the minimum open space requirement.

The Historic Preservation Board is guided by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the City of Hollywood's Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. These documents offer design controls for materials, scale, massing and location for all properties within the District. The proposed home is consistent with the character of the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

SITE BACKGROUND

Applicant/Owner: Got The Magic House LLC/Stephanie Halfen D./Matt Rosenblatt

Address/Location: 1015 South Southlake Drive
Size of Property: 23,397 sq.ft. (0.53 acres)
Present Zoning: Single-Family Residential (RS-9)

Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLOD-1)

Present Land Use: Low (5) Residential (LRES)

Present Use of Land: Single Family

Year Built: 1961/1974 (Broward County Property Appraiser)

ADJACENT ZONING

North: Southlake

South: Single-Family Residential District (RS-6)

Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLOD-1)

East: Single-Family Residential District (RS-9)

Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLOD-1)

West: Single-Family Residential District (RS-9)

Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLOD-1)

CONSISTENCY WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

Within the Comprehensive Plan, the primary goal of the Land Use Element is to promote a distribution of land uses that will enhance and improve the residential, business, resort and natural communities while allowing the landowners to maximize the use of their property.

The proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood, while allowing the Applicant to maximize the living area of their property.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN

The City-Wide Master Plan (CWMP) places a priority on protecting, preserving, and enhancing residential neighborhoods. It addresses the need for strict design controls to maintain the individual character of each neighborhood. The proposed home is sensitive to the character of the Historic Lakes Section through its design which possesses similar characteristics to existing structures in the surrounding neighborhood.

Policy 2.46: Preserve stable neighborhoods and encourage rehabilitation initiatives that will revitalize and promote stability of neighborhoods.

Policy CW.15: Place a priority on protecting, preserving, and enhancing residential neighborhoods.

The CWMP also states the single-family character of the area should be preserved and enhanced through strict zoning code enforcement, traffic calming and streetscape improvements. The project has minimal impact on the current streetscape while enhancing the landscaping.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE HOLLYWOOD LAKES NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN

The Hollywood Lakes Neighborhood Plan seeks to maintain and preserve the character and integrity of the existing residential community by protecting historical areas. It also seeks to eliminate the encroachment of negative residential uses.

The existing home was not constructed during a recognized period of significance and is not exemplary of any particular style.

APPLICABLE CRITERIA

Decisions on Certificates of Appropriateness for Demolition. Based on the following criteria and other appropriate considerations, the Board must determine if the building is of historic significance. The Zoning and Land Development Regulations does not provide guidance as to how much weight should be given to each criterion. Historic status shall be determined by the Board finding that the structure meets at least one of the review criteria for Historic Designation below:

- **CRITERION 1:** Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.
- **CRITERION 2:** Association with the lives of persons significant in our past.
- **CRITERION 3:** Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.
- **CRITERION 4:** Possession of high artistic values.
- **CRITERION 5:** Representation of the work of a master.
- **CRITERION 6:** Representation of a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

CRITERION 7: Yield, or the likelihood of yielding information important in prehistory or history.

Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition, as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5. Should the Board determine the status of the property is non-Historic, no further action is required, and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition shall be issued. If the Board determines that the status of the property is Historic, a recommendation by the Board shall be forwarded to the City Commission. The Board's recommendation shall be based upon the evaluation criteria below:

CRITERION 1: The building, structure, improvement, or site is designated on either a national, state, or local level as an historic preservation district or an architectural landmark or site.

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines recommend *identifying, retaining, and preserving* buildings which are important in defining the overall historic character of a historic district or neighborhood. The existing home was constructed in 1961/1974, and there is no historical merit in archival/permit history provided.

CRITERION 2: The building, structure, improvement, or site is of such design, craftsmanship, or material that it could be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.

ANALYSIS: The feasibility study provided showed an estimated cost of over 6 million to make improvements utilizing the existing structure, craftmanship, and materials. A key component of this cost is related to compliance with FEMA floodplain regulations, which is approximately double current Finish Floor Elevation (FFE). Provided that the original home was historical, there would be difficult and costly to reproduce reproduction.

CRITERION 3: The building, structure, improvement, or site is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the county, or the region.

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines allow for the removal of non-significant buildings, additions, or site features which detract from the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood. The existing two-story home was constructed in 1961/1974 which falls outside the Post War Modern Period of Significance. Contemporary homes were erected in mass to house a wave of new residents, as indicated by the Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. Therefore, examples of this kind of architecture are plentiful in the neighborhood.

CRITERION 4: The building, structure, improvement, or site contributes significantly to the historic character of a historically designated district.

ANALYSIS: Staff finds there is not substantial historic character that could be considered to significantly contribute to the character of the district.

CRITERION 5: Retention of the building, structure, improvement, or site promotes the general welfare of the city by providing an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, and design or by developing an understanding of the importance and value of a particular culture and heritage.

ANALYSIS: The existing home does not embody a structure steeped in architectural style or historical

character that would provide an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, or

design as it was built outside historical Period of Significance.

CRITERION 6: There are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried

out, and those plans will adversely effect on the historic character of the Historic District.

ANALYSIS: The Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home and construct a new home,

meeting all applicable code requirements. The proposed home is modern with an indoor/outdoor feel that allows the Applicant maximization of their use of their property. The design is enhanced by a formal landscape plan which includes an array of native species. As such, the proposed redevelopment of the property, if the demolition is

approved, will improve the character of the area.

CRITERION 7: The Unsafe Structures Board has ordered the demolition of a structure, or the feasibility

study determines that the retention of the building would deny the owner of all

economically viable uses of the property.

ANALYSIS: Not applicable. The Unsafe Structures Board has not ordered the demolition of this home.

CRITERION 8: The information listed in the Historic Properties Database (a listing of historic and non-

historic properties) has been considered as a guideline in determining whether a

Certification of Appropriateness for Demolition should be issued.

ANALYSIS: The existing home is not individually designated, and a Master Site File is not available for

the existing structure. The home was originally built outside a Period of Significance.

Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness of Design as stated in the City of

Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

CRITERION: INTEGRITY OF LOCATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines recommend maintaining consistent spacing and setbacks and further

state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings*. The proposed construction complies with required setbacks and site coverage and does not adversely affect the character of the neighborhood. The proposed home is compatible in scale and

massing with adjacent properties.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: DESIGN

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines encourages new construction to be compatible

with the character of the neighborhood with regard to scale, materials, texture, and color. The design element of scale relates to the size of the building components or spaces relative to the human body as well as to the larger context relative to the surrounding buildings, streetscape, and environment. Although the existing home does not fall within

a Period of Significance, the design pays homage to the Post War Modern Period by incorporating a flat roof with extendable overhangs, extended glass areas, and an asymmetrical horizontal emphasis.

FINDING: Consistent

CRITERION: SETTING

ANALYSIS: According to the Design Guidelines, setting is the relationship of buildings within the

Historic District and the surrounding site and neighborhood. The home as proposed demonstrates compatibility with the neighborhood as it does not disrupt the relationship in terms of architectural style, height, and setbacks. The proposed home is compatible

with the surrounding neighborhood while maintaining its uniqueness.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: MATERIALS

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines state materials are an important part of the fabric of any historic district

or property and help to maintain the historic character. The proposed materials are compatible and consistent in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to other contemporary homes in the historic district using architectural features such as flat roofs,

extended glass areas, and wood elements.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: WORKMANSHIP

ANALYSIS: The proposed design is consistent with current workmanship styles and methods and

does not replicate or copy any existing style or period while complying with all regulations and it fits within the neighborhood's character. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will enhance the ambience achieved by the home's design, allowing for shade, visibility,

and framing of the property.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: ASSOCIATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines recommend maintaining consistent spacing and setbacks and further

state new construction should be compatible with existing buildings... Within the context of historic preservation, elements of design such as massing, scale and rhythm reflect architectural style as well as the richness of the historic district. Meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood. This project enhances the streetscape elements of the existing residence and the neighbors. As such, the proposed redevelopment of the property, if the

demolition is approved, will maintain, and improve the character of the area.

FINDING: Consistent.

ATTACHMENTS

ATTACHMENT A: Application Package
ATTACHMENT B: Aerial Photograph
ATTACHMENT C: Permit History