

BID REVIEW LETTER

Attn: Mr. Luis Lopez, P.E.
Engineering Support Services Manager
Design and Construction Management

Project Name: City of Hollywood Tidal Flooding Mitigation and Shoreline Protection

CC Project #: 84300

Project Address: Hollywood, FL

Date: February 18, 2025

RE: Review of bids for the proposed Shoreline Protection Located at Sites 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 14, 15, and 16

Dear Mr. Lopez:

The following is a summary review of bids obtained for the City of Hollywood Tidal Flooding Mitigation and Shoreline Protection project at the site listed above in Hollywood, FL (Project). Cummins Cederberg, Inc. (Cummins Cederberg) was retained to assist in reviewing bids from marine contractors and providing a summary comparison of the received bids.

Bids were received from the two (2) marine contractors: **Ebsary** and **Shoreline Foundation, Inc. (SFI)**.

A technical review of the comprehensive bid package, as developed by the City, was completed. This included a detailed review of Form 3 – Bid Form, Form 4 – Vendor Reference Form, and Form 14 – List of Subcontractors to identify the lowest, qualified bidder. Bid responsiveness shall be completed by the City's Procurement Department.

Bid Comparison

Bidders were requested to provide their respective bids on a supplied itemized bid form. Table 1 below provides a comparison of contractor bid prices for each group of sites. Subtotal and Total values were adopted directly from the contractor-provided bid form. Table 2 provides an in-depth comparison of contractor bid prices with itemized lite items per the sub-sections as follows:

- Section 1 – Site 3 - General
- Section 2 – Site 3 - Construction
- Section 3 – Sites 4 & 5 - General
- Section 4 – Sites 4 & 5 - Construction
- Section 5 – Sites 11 & 12 - General
- Section 6 – Sites 11 & 12 - Construction
- Section 7 – Sites 7, 8, 14, 15 & 16 - General
- Section 8 – Sites 7, 8, 14, 15 & 16 - Construction

TABLE 1 – SUMMARY OF SUBMITTED BIDS

Summary of Submitted Bid Prices		
Description	Ebsary	SFI
Subtotal Site 3	\$1,693,205	\$1,537,653
Subtotal Sites 4 & 5	\$964,350	\$601,047
Subtotal Sites 11 & 12	\$182,950	\$221,176
Subtotal Sites 7, 8, 14, 15 & 16	\$1,876,475	1,288,932
Total	\$4,716,980	\$3,648,808

TABLE 2 – IN-DEPTH LINE ITEM BID COMPARISON

Site 3 - General				
Item No.	Description	Qty	Ebsary	SFI
1.1	Mobilization / Demobilization	1	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,295.00
1.2	Turbidity Containment	1	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 19,834.00
1.3	Layout/ As-Built Surveys	1	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 14,942.00
1.4	Site Restoration	1	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 22,414.00
1.5	Permit Conditions	1	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 15,988.00
1.6	Grant, State, Federal Contract Compliance, Davids Bacon Wage Rates, Buy America	1	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 7,994.00
Site 3 - Construction				
2.1	Removal and Disposal Concrete Cap	32	\$ 13,600.00	\$ 3,552.00
2.2	Removal and Disposal Upland Concrete Ramp	1	\$ 6,825.00	\$ 1,095.00

2.3	Removal and Disposal Concrete Boat Ramp	2	\$ 33,000.00	\$ 10,944.00
2.4	Removal and Disposal Floating Dock	1	\$ 6,400.00	\$ 6,189.00
2.5	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 24" x 24"	304	\$ 159,600.00	\$ 137,712.00
2.6	Furnish & Install NZ-14 Sheet Pile	304	\$ 408,880.00	\$ 253,536.00
2.7	Furnish & Install HP 14" x 102"	2	\$ 43,000.00	\$ 13,976.00
2.8	Furnish & Install Conc Slab, 8"	1,460	\$ 81,760.00	\$ 137,970.00
2.10	Furnish & Install Aluminum Kayak Ramp	1	\$ 195,000.00	\$ 228,348.00
2.11	Furnish & Install NZ-14 Sheet Pile (Boat Ramp)	166	\$ 224,100.00	\$ 148,072.00
2.12	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 24" x 24" (Boat Ramp)	166	\$ 107,070.00	\$ 80,344.00
2.13	Furnish and Install Aluminum Handrail (Boat Ramp)	38	\$ 26,220.00	\$ 19,114.00
2.14	#57 Gravel Fill	125	\$ 26,250.00	\$ 61,250.00
2.15	Earthwork, Fill, Clearing and Grubbing	1	\$ 43,000.00	\$ 65,268.00
2.16	Storm Water Improvements	1	\$ 33,500.00	\$ 90,512.00
2.10	Landscaping	1	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 18,304.00
Sites 4 & 5 - General				
1.1	Mobilization / Demobilization	1	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 12,501.00
1.2	Turbidity Containment	1	\$ 19,000.00	\$ 8,427.00
1.3	Layout/ As-Built Surveys	1	\$ 9,500.00	\$ 22,414.00
1.4	Site Restoration	1	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 14,942.00
1.5	Permit Conditions	1	\$ 7,000.00	\$ 15,988.00
1.6	Grant, State, Federal Contract Compliance, Davids Bacon Wage Rates, Buy America	1	\$ 7,000.00	\$ 7,994.00
Site 4 - Construction				
2.1	Milling of Existing Asphalt	12	\$ 8,940.00	\$ 540.00
2.2	Removal & Disposal of Guardrail	26	\$ 8,840.00	\$ 3,250.00
2.3	Removal & Disposal of Outfall Pipe	10	\$ 8,800.00	\$ 6,120.00
2.5	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 28" x 24"	111	\$ 59,385.00	\$ 55,611.00
2.6	Furnish & Install NZ-14 Sheet Pile	107	\$ 170,130.00	\$ 94,588.00
2.7	Furnish & Install HP 14" x 102"	2	\$ 49,000.00	\$ 15,096.00
2.8	Furnish & Install 36" HDPE Pipe Splice	2	\$ 10,400.00	\$ 33,516.00
2.10	Furnish & Install 36" HDPE Pipe	10	\$ 11,250.00	\$ 4,910.00
2.11	Mangrove Trimming	296	\$ 6,600.00	\$ 10,508.00
2.12	Clearing and Grubbing	1	\$ 20,450.00	\$ 2,874.00
2.13	Landscaping	1	\$ 36,000.00	\$ 2,690.00

Site 5 - Construction				
3.1	Removal & Disposal of Conc Pad	1	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 5,038.00
3.2	Milling of Existing Asphalt	12	\$ 9,300.00	\$ 540.00
3.3	Removal & Disposal of Guardrail	26	\$ 8,970.00	\$ 1,807.00
3.4	Removal & Disposal of Outfall Pipe	10	\$ 8,850.00	\$ 6,120.00
3.5	Furnish & Install NZ-14 Sheet Pile	108	\$ 171,720.00	\$ 94,716.00
3.6	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 28" x 24"	112	\$ 59,920.00	\$ 56,112.00
3.7	Furnish & Install HP 14" x 102"	2	\$ 49,000.00	\$ 19,892.00
3.8	Furnish & Install 36" HDPE Pipe Splice	2	\$ 10,400.00	\$ 33,516.00
3.9	Furnish & Install 36" HDPE Pipe	10	\$ 11,250.00	\$ 4,910.00
3.10	Mangrove Trimming	639	\$ 9,585.00	\$ 10,863.00
3.11	Clearing and Grubbing	1	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 2,874.00
3.12	Landscaping	1	\$ 38,000.00	\$ 2,690.00
Sites 11 & 12 - General				
1.1	Mobilization / Demobilization	1	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 9,000.00
1.2	Turbidity Containment	1	\$ 5,500.00	\$ 7,000.00
1.3	Layout/ As-Built Surveys	1	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 9,000.00
1.4	Site Restoration	1	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 7,000.00
1.5	Permit Conditions	1	\$ 3,500.00	\$ 7,500.00
1.6	Grant, State, Federal Contract Compliance, Davids Bacon Wage Rates, Buy America	1	\$ 3,500.00	\$ 3,500.00
Site 11 - Construction				
2.1	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 47" x 24"	50	\$ 24,750.00	\$ 60,000.00
2.2	Landscaping	1	\$ 17,000.00	\$ 1,793.00
Site 12 - Construction				
3.1	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 52" x 24"	50	\$ 24,750.00	\$ 60,000.00
3.2	Mangrove Trimming	270	\$ 9,450.00	\$ 4,590.00
3.3	Landscaping	1	\$ 17,000.00	\$ 1,793.00
Sites 7, 8, 14, 15, & 16 - General				
1.1	Mobilization / Demobilization	1	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 25,715.00
1.2	Turbidity Containment	1	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 28,477.00
1.3	Layout/ As-Built Surveys	1	\$ 22,000.00	\$ 56,034.00
1.4	Site Restoration	1	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 37,356.00
1.5	Permit Conditions	1	\$ 16,500.00	\$ 15,988.00
1.6	Grant, State, Federal Contract Compliance, Davids Bacon Wage Rates, Buy America	1	\$ 16,500.00	\$ 7,994.00

Site 7 – Construction				
2.1	Removal & Disposal of Grout Bags	1	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 7,616.00
2.2	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 28" x 24"	65	\$ 38,350.00	\$ 35,425.00
2.3	Furnish & Install NZ-14 Sheet Pile	61	\$ 103,700.00	\$ 76,494.00
2.4	Furnish & Install HP 14" x 102"	2	\$ 47,000.00	\$ 26,454.00
2.5	Fill	12	\$ 4,380.00	\$ 4,800.00
2.6	Furnish & Install HDPE Pipe	1	\$ 13,600.00	\$ 491.00
2.7	Furnish & Install HDPE Pipe Splice	1	\$ 12,750.00	\$ 16,758.00
2.8	Landscaping	1	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 1,793.00

Site 8 - Construction				
3.1	Removal & Disposal of Concrete cap	46	\$ 20,700.00	\$ 5,014.00
3.2	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 28" x 24"	46	\$ 27,140.00	\$ 25,070.00
3.3	Furnish & Install NZ-14 Sheet Pile	46	\$ 78,200.00	\$ 50,876.00
3.4	Furnish & Install HP 14" x 102"	2	\$ 47,000.00	\$ 26,454.00
3.5	Furnish & Install 36" HDPE Pipe	1	\$ 16,000.00	\$ 491.00
3.6	Furnish & Install 36" HPDE Pipe Splice	1	\$ 9,100.00	\$ 16,758.00
3.7	Landscaping	1	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 1,793.00

Site 14 - Construction				
4.1	Removal & Disposal of Conc Cap	52	\$ 23,400.00	\$ 5,668.00
4.2	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 36" x 16"	52	\$ 31,460.00	\$ 28,340.00
4.3	Furnish & Install NZ-14 Sheet Pile	51	\$ 105,060.00	\$ 71,196.00
4.4	Furnish & Install HP 14" x 102"	2	\$ 53,000.00	\$ 26,454.00
4.5	Landscaping	1	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 1,793.00

Site 15 - Construction				
5.1	Removal & Disposal of Conc Cap	50	\$ 22,500.00	\$ 5,450.00
5.2	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 28" x 24"	52	\$ 31,460.00	\$ 28,340.00
5.3	Furnish & Install NZ-14 Sheet Pile	51	\$ 102,000.00	\$ 80,529.00
5.4	Furnish & Install HP 14" x 102"	2	\$ 53,200.00	\$ 26,454.00
5.5	Cleaning and Grubbing	1	\$ 11,500.00	\$ 2,874.00
5.5	Landscaping	1	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 1,793.00

Site 16 - Construction				
6.1	Removal & Disposal of Conc Cap	50	\$ 22,500.00	\$ 5,450.00
6.2	Furnish & Install Conc Cap, 36" x 24"	175	\$ 105,875.00	\$ 95,375.00
6.3	Furnish & Install NZ-14 Sheet Pile	190	\$ 359,100.00	\$ 280,110.00
6.4	Furnish & Install HP 14" x 102"	2	\$ 52,000.00	\$ 26,588.00
6.5	Cleaning and Grubbing	1	\$ 11,500.00	\$ 2,874.00
6.6	Landscaping	1	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 1,793.00

Comments and Recommendations

- For the base bid inclusive of all work scopes, **the bid from Shoreline Foundation, Inc. was the lowest at \$3,648,808.00.**
- The bid received from Ebsary came in at \$4,716,980.00.
- The bids from Shoreline Foundation, Inc. were lower than Ebsary for Site 3, Sites 4 & 5, and Sites 7, 8, 14, 15, & 16 but higher for Sites 11 & 12.
- The overall bids for the work were within 29% of each other.
- The bids for the work on Site 3 were within 10% of each other. The bids for the work on Sites 4 & 5 were within 60% of each other. The bids for the work on Sites 11 & 12 were within 21% of each other. The bids for the work on Sites 7, 8, 14, 15, & 16 were with 46% of each other.
- Some of the largest price differentials came from landscaping and cleaning and grubbing costs. Ebsary came in up to 10x higher than the Shoreline Foundation, Inc. costs.
- Mobilization costs for Ebsary were typically 30-50% higher than the Shoreline mobilization costs.
- The provided Bid Form stated that Site 16 has 175 LF of cap and 190 LF of sheet pile. This appears to be an error on the bid drawings where approximately 52 LF of sheet pile and cap are proposed. The prices provided by Ebsary and Shoreline reflect the 175 LF and 190 LF, respectively. Both Contractors state this in their bid response. It does not appear this discrepancy impacts the overall price difference between the Contractors. A credit to the selected Contractor or adjustment in contract price is recommended.
- Both Contractors stated they will be utilizing two (2) subcontractors. Shoreline Foundation, Inc. did not identify the subcontractors by name. Shoreline Foundation, Inc. is proposing to use subcontractors for paving and landscaping. Ebsary is proposing to use subcontractors for cast-in-place concrete and site work/drainage.
- The submitted references and project experience were relevant and comparable for both Contractors. Cummins Cederberg has successfully worked with both Contractors on marine construction work in South Florida.
- Both contractors confirmed they could complete the scope of work within the specified project schedule established in the bid documents.
- **Based on the review of the bids, Shoreline Foundation, Inc. is the lowest, qualified bidder for the work based on the submitted bids. Cummins Cederberg recommends proceeding to contract negotiations with Shoreline Foundation, Inc. to initiate the Project.**

We appreciate the opportunity to assist with this project for the City of Hollywood. The above summary is limited and only intended to support the bidding and ultimate contractor selection. No other warranty, expressed or implied, is herewith made. Should there be any questions or comments relative to the above summary, please do not hesitate to contact me at (561) 658-1296 or jchiefet@cumminscederberg.com.

Sincerely,
CUMMINS CEDERBERG, INC.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'J. Cheifet', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Jordon Cheifet, P.E.
Director, Office Lead

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'S. Orsay', with a horizontal flourish.

Stephen Orsay, P.E.
Project Engineer