

**CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA
DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES
PLANNING AND URBAN DESIGN DIVISION**

DATE: November 14, 2023 **FILE:** 23-CM-65

TO: Historic Preservation Board

VIA: Anand Balram, Planning Manager

FROM: Carmen A. Diaz, Planning Administrator

SUBJECT: Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for a three-unit residential townhouse development within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

REQUEST:

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for a three-unit residential development within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

RECOMMENDATION:

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition: To be determined by the Historic Preservation Board.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: Recommend Approval if Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition is approved.

BACKGROUND

According to the records of the Broward County Property Appraiser, the existing house was constructed in 1958 on a 9,084 sq. ft. lot (0.22 acres) located at 1619 Hollywood Boulevard. The subject property is composed of two lots, specifically Lots 7 and 8 of Block 73. The design of the existing home is a Ranch architectural style, which includes horizontal elements, asymmetry, hipped roofs, and limited ornamentation. *The Design Guidelines state that Ranch Style homes were most prevalent during the post war periods to accommodate many soldiers familiar with the subtropical environment during training in Hollywood or other locations, returned to South Florida with new young families. Ranch homes were erected in mass to house a wave of new residents. This style was relatively inexpensive and used simple materials with none of the traditional details.*

REQUEST

The Applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design to demolish the existing building and provide three new townhomes in compliance with the Zoning and Land Development Regulations. The existing building is in poor condition based on the Feasibility Study done by a Structural Engineer (See attachment A). Currently, the existing structures do not meet the necessary Building Code requirements, as well as FEMA regulations. The structures present several issues that would increase the costs of an addition or retrofitting to resolve these problems. Therefore, with cost and safety in consideration, the Applicant has moved to construct a new residential development conforming to current regulations, including FEMA.

The proposed residential development demonstrates a contemporary design. Rather than imitating historic styles, the presence on the street is created by the rhythm and scale. The new construction shows a true transition from a single-family zoning district to a denser, taller, and faster paced downtown area as part of the Lakes Transition District which allows multifamily residences. The Lakes Transition District is within the Regional Activity Center (RAC) and also part of the Historic District. The proposed buildings have a modern style using composite siding as a vertical sculptural element from the top to the entry door of the townhomes. The main façade of the townhomes is facing Hollywood Boulevard and each entrance is elevated from the street level with a few steps and aluminum railings. Each townhome has the common areas located on the first floor as well as the garage and an open patio which are facing the alley. The second and third floor have the bedrooms and more private areas; the roof is an open terrace. The new construction will comply with all the required setbacks, height, and parking regulations.

As mentioned, the property is in the RAC. The City’s Zoning and Land Development Regulations offers the advantage of creating an urban fabric. The RAC provides the opportunity to switch from a single-family residential area to a multifamily building, as the subject property is located close to the downtown commercial areas.

The Historic Preservation Board is guided by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the City of Hollywood’s Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. These documents offer design controls for materials, scale, massing, and location for all properties within the district. The design of the proposed development is an example of the new RAC zoning requirements inside the Historic area. As proposed, the design maintains the spatial relationship with surrounding properties in its scale and massing.

SITE INFORMATION

Owner/Applicant:	Norma Garcia and Mariela Cardona
Address/Location:	1619 Hollywood Boulevard
Size of Property:	9,084 sq. ft. (0.21 acres)
Present Zoning:	Lakes Transition District (LT) Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District
Future Land Use:	Regional Activity Center (RAC)
Year Built:	1959/1958 (Broward County Property Appraiser)

ADJACENT ZONING

North:	Lakes Transition District (LT) Lakes Harrison and Tyler Street Historic Districts (HPOD-2)
South:	Lakes Transition District (LT)

East: Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)
Lakes Transition District (LT)
West: Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)
Lakes Transition District (LT)
Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)

CONSISTENCY WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

Located within the Regional Activity Center and part of the Historic District, the subject site is surrounded by mostly residential properties, the primary goal of the Land Use Element is to *promote a distribution of land uses that will enhance and improve the residential, business, resort and natural communities while allowing the land owners to maximize the use of their property.* The intent of the Regional Activity Center land use designation is to *encourage redevelopment or development of areas that are regionally significant. The major purposes of this designation are to facilitate multi-use and mixed-use development, encourage mass transit, reduce the need to automobile travel, provide incentives for quality development, and give definition to the urban form.* Development of this site enhances the neighborhood redevelopment of the area and provides a model for new development within the Regional Activity Center.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN

The City-Wide Master Plan (CWMP) places a priority on protecting, preserving, and enhancing residential neighborhoods. It addresses the need for strict design controls to maintain the individual character of each neighborhood. The proposed development is sensitive to the character of the Historic Lakes Section through its design which is similar to existing structures in the surrounding neighborhood.

Policy 2.46: *Preserve stable neighborhoods and encourage rehabilitation initiatives that will revitalize and promote stability of neighborhoods.*

Policy CW.15: *Place a priority on protecting, preserving, and enhancing residential neighborhoods.*

The CWMP also states *the single-family character of the area should be preserved and enhanced through strict zoning code enforcement, traffic calming and streetscape improvements.* The project has minimal impact on the current streetscape while enhancing the landscaping.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE HOLLYWOOD LAKES NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN

The Hollywood Lakes Neighborhood Plan seeks to maintain and preserve the character and integrity of the existing residential community by protecting historical areas. It also seeks to eliminate the encroachment of negative residential uses. The location of the property in the Lakes Transition District, a new zoning district inside the RAC provides some variation on new proposed developments. It is a transition between Young Circle to the Hollywood Lakes Historic District. The Lakes Transition District encourages redevelopment which retains and enhances the existing character of the Lakes Historic District and also creates urban residential neighborhoods.

The existing one-story home was constructed in 1958. It is an example of a Ranch style home; however, the existing house requires restoration to improve the deteriorating conditions. The Applicant is proposing three townhomes with a contemporary design. Therefore, the proposal for the redevelopment of the site will not adversely affect the integrity of the Historic District.

APPLICABLE CRITERIA

Decisions on Certificates of Appropriateness for Demolition. Based on the following criteria and other appropriate considerations, the Board must determine if the building is of historic significance. The Zoning and Land Development Regulations does not provide guidance as to how much weight should be given to each criterion. *In addition to the mandatory criteria, the designation of any individual site or district as a Historic Site or District requires compliance with at least one of the following additional criteria:*

Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

CRITERION 1: The building, structure, improvement, or site is designated on either a National, State, or local level as a Historic Preservation District or an Architectural Landmark or site.

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines recommend *identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings which are important in defining the overall historic character of a historic district or neighborhood.* There is one building on site which was built in 1958. The building was built as a single-family home. The architecture is Ranch style. There is no evidence that it has historical significance, neither is listed as a historic building.

CRITERION 2: The building, structure, improvement, or site is of such design, craftsmanship, or material that it could be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.

ANALYSIS: The structure as it exists today does not exhibit characteristics or elements that are unique or contributing to the character of the Historic District. In addition, the existing building is in very poor condition based on the Feasibility Study. There may be portion of the structure or design element on the building that could not be reproduced or replicated without great difficulty or expense, any substantial improvement to the property would require great cost to raise the floor elevation and resolve the structural issues.

CRITERION 3: The building, structure, improvement, or site is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the county, or the region.

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines allow for the *removal of non-significant buildings, additions, or site features which detract from the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood.* As previously stated, although the existing building was constructed in 1958, it does not possess distinct historic architectural features. Furthermore, The Design Guidelines states that Post War Modern, Ranch Style homes were most prevalent during the post war periods and were constructed in mass to accommodate the influx of returning soldiers and new families moving to the south Florida region.

CRITERION 4: The building, structure, improvement, or site contributes significantly to the historic character of a historically designated district.

ANALYSIS: Staff finds there is not substantial historic character that could be considered to significantly contribute to the character of the district.

CRITERION 5: Retention of the building, structure, improvement, or site promotes the general welfare of the city by providing an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, and design or by developing an understanding of the importance and value of a particular culture and heritage.

ANALYSIS: As stated previously, the existing building does not embody a structure steeped in architectural style or historical character that would provide an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, or design.

CRITERION 6: There are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and those plans will adversely effect on the historic character of the Historic District.

ANALYSIS: The Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing building and construct a new residential development. Meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighbors. The proposed multifamily building is contemporary and functional, allowing the Applicant to maximize the use of his property. The design is enhanced by a formal landscape plan which provides an array of native species. Required parking is accommodated with a garage and a paved driveway. As such, the proposed redevelopment of the property, if the demolition is approved, will improve the character of the area.

CRITERION 7: The Unsafe Structures Board has ordered the demolition of a structure, or the feasibility study determines that the retention of the building would deny the owner of all economically viable uses of the property.

ANALYSIS: The Unsafe Structures Board has not ordered the demolition of these buildings. However, the engineer's report shows that improvements would not be economically feasible as both buildings would need to be raised to meet FEMA requirements and other various structural issues that would need to be addressed to allow renovations. This would severely impact the cost of the project and impede the Applicant's ability to move forward with design in a manner that is financially feasible or sound. The reinvestment in the property without the freedom of design for a property that does not represent a period of significance or possess historic merit would be an undue burden for the Applicant.

CRITERION 8: The information listed in the Historic Properties Database (a listing of historic and non-historic properties) has been considered as a guideline in determining whether a Certification of Appropriateness for Demolition should be issued.

ANALYSIS: The Applicant states in his Criteria Statement that the home has no historic merit based on their research. It is not individually designated, and a Florida Site File was not found.

Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness of Design as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

CRITERION: INTEGRITY OF LOCATION

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines encourages new structures to be compatible with the character of the neighborhood with regard to scale, materials, texture, and color. The design element of scale relates to the size of the building components or spaces relative to the human body as well as to the larger context relative to the surrounding buildings, streetscape, and environment. The proposed development complies with required regulations. The proposed development maintains a residential pattern and provides a transition into the downtown area as allowed by the LT zoning district.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: DESIGN

ANALYSIS: The Historic Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks and further state new construction should be compatible with existing buildings. Within the context of historic preservation, elements of design such as massing, scale, and rhythm reflect architectural style as well as the richness of the historic district.* The proposed design demonstrates a contemporary design that can be found throughout the Lakes district. This contemporary building is designed in a manner that provides an urban feeling. This unique design gives presence to the architecture of its time, while adding character to the Historic Lakes district; this is achieved through a mixture of materials such as, concrete panels, wood, glass, and aluminum elements. The Historic District's richness is derived from the design of the homes being appropriate for the period in which they were constructed. The Applicant is proposing a design that represents the current architectural styles of the time, and other homes throughout the Lakes district.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: SETTING

ANALYSIS: The Historic Design Guidelines states that setting is *the relationship of a building to adjacent buildings and the surrounding site environment.* The proposed residential development meets all applicable setback requirements. The modern design offers a character to the neighborhood throughout the Lakes district maintaining the spatial relationship with surrounding properties adjacent to the downtown area. Massing plays an important role in determining the character of individual properties, the street, and the surrounding neighborhood. The new construction provides a similar proportion with the surrounding properties, complying with the Design Guidelines.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: MATERIALS

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines state materials are an important part of the fabric of any historic district or property and help to maintain the historic character of the place. Furthermore, materials should be compatible in quality to those that are used in the historic district. The Applicant has demonstrated that the proposed design, while utilizing modern methods of construction and materials, will not affect the integrity of the surrounding neighborhood. It is a design example and proposal inside the Lakes Transition District.

This unique design gives presence to the architecture of its time, while adding character to the Historic Lakes district; this is achieved through a mixture of materials such as, concrete panels, glass, and wood, elements. Appropriate elements with contemporary materials and methods of construction are provided. Geometries of the building are accentuated with different materials, colors, and hierarchies to create interest and shadow throughout.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: WORKMANSHIP

ANALYSIS: According to the National Register, workmanship is the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory. It is the evidence of artisans' labor and skill in constructing or altering a building, structure, object, or site. Workmanship can apply to the property as a whole or to its individual components. It can be expressed in vernacular methods of construction and plain finishes or in highly sophisticated configurations and ornamental detailing. It can be based on common traditions or innovative period techniques.

The design of the proposed development is consistent with current workmanship styles and methods. The proposed improvements are not imitating or copying any existing style or period. In addition, the proposal does comply with all regulations, and it fits within the neighborhood's character.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: ASSOCIATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further states *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings... Within the context of historic preservation, elements of design such as massing, scale and rhythm reflect architectural style as well as the richness of the historic district.* Meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design enhances the site, and is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent properties and surrounding neighborhood. It is enhanced by a formal landscape plan around the building. Required parking is accommodated in the driveway and the attached garages.

FINDING: Consistent.

ATTACHMENTS

ATTACHMENT A: Application Package

ATTACHMENT B: Aerial Photograph