

City of Hollywood

Procurement Services

Steve Stewart, Chief Procurement Officer 2600 Hollywood Boulevard, Hollywood, FL 33020

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFQ No. RFQ-118-23-JJ

DESIGN, CONSTRUCTION ENGINEERING AND INSPECTION SERVICES

RESPONSE DEADLINE: October 2, 2023 at 3:00 pm Report Generated: Monday, December 11, 2023

PHASE 1

EVALUATORS

Name	Title
Juan Figueroa	Senior Project Manager
Giselle Hipolito	Engineeer
Clarissa Ip	Assistant City Engineer
Jeff Jiang	Assistant Director
Wilhelmina Montero	Senior Project Manager

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Firm Qualifications and Experience	Points Based	25 (25% of Total)

Description:

Overall approach, similar project experience and project management

DESIGN, CONSTRUCTION ENGINEERING AND INSPECTION SERVICES

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Organizational Profile and Project Team Qualifications	Points Based	25 (25% of Total)

Description:

Professional experience and qualifications of team members

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Approach to Scope of Work	Points Based	25 (25% of Total)

Description:

Understanding City's needs, goals and objectives, overview of proposed vision, ideas, and methodology, as it relates to meeting project budget and timeline for completion.

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Past Performance - References	Points Based	15 (15% of Total)

Description:

Provide at least three references, preferably from Government entities, for completed projects with similar Scope contained in this RFQ.

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Value of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years	Points Based	5 (5% of Total)

Description:

Volume of work awarded to each firm with the object of equitable distribution among equally qualified firms, provided such does not violate the principle of the selection of the most qualified firm

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Location of Respondent Office Managing Project	Points Based	5 (5% of Total)

Description:

Proximity and overall distance from the Consultant's office that will perform the work to the City of Hollywood.

AGGREGATE SCORES SUMMARY

Vendor	Juan Figueroa	Giselle Hipolito	Clarissa Ip	Jeff Jiang	Wilhelmina Montero	Total Score (Max Score 100)
Arcadis U.S., Inc.	96	73	90	90	95	88.8
Tetra Tech, Inc.	97	76	86	91	93	88.6
Craven, Thompson & Associates, Inc.	95	68	88	89	92	86.4
EAC Consulting Inc	86	67	88	86	91	83.6
BCC Engineering LLC	84	73	88	84	88	83.4

Vendor	Juan Figueroa	Giselle Hipolito	Clarissa Ip	Jeff Jiang	Wilhelmina Montero	Total Score (Max Score 100)
Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.	77	63	90	91	91	82.4
R.J. Behar & Company, Inc.	84	63.5	83	84	88	80.5
Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc.	79	59	79	83	81	76.2
Ally Engineering Services, Inc.	76	60	65	79	77	71.4
Craig A. Smith & Associates LLC	80	52	69	78	77	71.2

VENDOR SCORES BY EVALUATION CRITERIA

Vendor	Firm Qualifications and Experience Points Based 25 Points (25%)	Organizational Profile and Project Team Qualifications Points Based 25 Points (25%)	Approach to Scope of Work Points Based 25 Points (25%)	Past Performance - References Points Based 15 Points (15%)	Value of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years Points Based 5 Points (5%)	Location of Respondent Office Managing Project Points Based 5 Points (5%)	Total Score (Max Score 100)
Arcadis U.S., Inc.	23.2	22.2	23	13.4	2	5	88.8
Tetra Tech, Inc.	23	21.6	23.2	13.8	2	5	88.6
Craven, Thompson & Associates, Inc.	22.3	21	22.5	13.6	2	5	86.4
EAC Consulting Inc	22	20.8	20.8	13	2	5	83.6
BCC Engineering LLC	22	20	21.2	10.2	5	5	83.4
Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.	21.3	20.6	21.5	12	2	5	82.4

EVALUATION TABULATION

Request For Qualification - DESIGN, CONSTRUCTION ENGINEERING AND INSPECTION SERVICES

Vendor	Firm Qualifications and Experience Points Based 25 Points (25%)	Organizational Profile and Project Team Qualifications Points Based 25 Points (25%)	Approach to Scope of Work Points Based 25 Points (25%)	Past Performance - References Points Based 15 Points (15%)	Value of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years Points Based 5 Points (5%)	Location of Respondent Office Managing Project Points Based 5 Points (5%)	Total Score (Max Score 100)
R.J. Behar & Company, Inc.	20.5	19.4	19.8	10.8	5	5	80.5
Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc.	19.6	18.4	19	10.2	4	5	76.2
Ally Engineering Services, Inc.	19	16.2	17.8	8.4	5	5	71.4
Craig A. Smith & Associates LLC	18.5	17.6	18.5	9.6	2	5	71.2

INDIVIDUAL PROPOSAL SCORES

Ally Engineering Services, Inc.

Firm Qualifications and Experience | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 24

Ally is a small but qualified firm focused on CEI. As a firm Ally's experience seems to be very strong in roadway and drainage. However, Mr. Gonzalo Giraldo's 36 years of experience in CEI is very Impressive, and about 15 of those years in the Municipal Utilities Sector.

Giselle Hipolito: 15

Clarissa Ip: 16

Jeff Jiang: 20

Juan Figueroa: 15

Kathy Jeffries, with Calvin Giordano, a sub, has compliance experience focused on FDOT projects; may transfer to what we need but there will be a learning curve. Our needs are experience with Broward County MAPS and FDOC grants.

Giselle Hipolito: 12

Clarissa Ip: 16

Jeff Jiang: 20

Wilhelmina Montero: 18

Approach to Scope of Work | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 20

The approach to the Scope of work is well thought out and sound.

Giselle Hipolito: 15

Clarissa Ip: 16

Jeff Jiang: 19

Wilhelmina Montero: 19

Past Performance - References | Points Based | 15 Points (15%)

Juan Figueroa: 7

The submitted references were for roadway and drainage projects. I would like to have seen more watermain and sewer experience.

Giselle Hipolito: 8

Clarissa Ip: 7

Jeff Jiang: 10

Wilhelmina Montero: 10

EVALUATION TABULATION

Request For Qualification - DESIGN, CONSTRUCTION ENGINEERING AND INSPECTION SERVICES

Value	e of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years Points Based 5 Points (5%)
	Juan Figueroa: 5
	Giselle Hipolito: 5
	Clarissa Ip: 5
	Jeff Jiang: 5
	Wilhelmina Montero: 5
	Location of Respondent Office Managing Project Points Based 5 Points (5%)
	Juan Figueroa: 5
	Giselle Hipolito: 5
	Clarissa Ip: 5
	Jeff Jiang: 5

Arcadis U.S., Inc.

Firm Qualifications and Experience | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 25

Over 20 years of experience, inclusive of 4-Log projects. plenty of infrastructure experience.

Giselle Hipolito: 20

Clarissa Ip: 23

Jeff Jiang: 23

Wilhelmina Montero: 25

Organizational Profile and Project Team Qualifications | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 24

Giselle Hipolito: 16

Clarissa Ip: 24

Jeff Jiang: 23

Wilhelmina Montero: 24

Approach to Scope of Work | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 25

Grant and funding management experience (12 Years)-Secured over \$5B over 10 years. Extensive CAS and CEI experience.

Giselle Hipolito: 20

Clarissa Ip: 23

Jeff Jiang: 23

Wilhelmina Montero: 24

Past Performance - References | Points Based | 15 Points (15%)

Juan Figueroa: 15

Giselle Hipolito: 10

Clarissa Ip: 13

Jeff Jiang: 14

Value of	f Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years	Points Based 5 Points (5%)
	Juan Figueroa: 2	
	Giselle Hipolito: 2	
	Clarissa Ip: 2	
	Jeff Jiang: 2	
	Wilhelmina Montero: 2	
Lo	cation of Respondent Office Managing Project Poir	its Based 5 Points (5%)
	Juan Figueroa: 5	
	Giselle Hipolito: 5	
	Clarissa Ip: 5	
	Jeff Jiang: 5	
	Wilhelmina Montero: 5	

BCC Engineering LLC
Firm Qualifications and Experience Points Based 25 Points (25%)
Juan Figueroa: 22
The qualification package showed plenty of experience in infrastructure projects.
Giselle Hipolito: 20
Clarissa Ip: 23
Jeff Jiang: 22
Wilhelmina Montero: 23

Juan Figueroa: 20

I would have liked to see their grant management experience outside of Hollywood; not just obtaining funding but managing grant compliance,

Giselle Hipolito: 15

Clarissa Ip: 22

Jeff Jiang: 20

Wilhelmina Montero: 23

Approach to Scope of Work | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 22

Giselle Hipolito: 20

Clarissa Ip: 23

Jeff Jiang: 19

Wilhelmina Montero: 22

Past Performance - References | Points Based | 15 Points (15%)

Juan Figueroa: 10

Giselle Hipolito: 8

Clarissa Ip: 10

Jeff Jiang: 13

Value of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years Points Based 5 Points (5%)
Juan Figueroa: 5
Giselle Hipolito: 5
Clarissa Ip: 5
Jeff Jiang: 5
Wilhelmina Montero: 5
Location of Respondent Office Managing Project Points Based 5 Points (5%)
Juan Figueroa: 5
Giselle Hipolito: 5
Clarissa Ip: 5
Jeff Jiang: 5
Wilhelmina Montero: 5

Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc.	
Firm Qualifications and Experience Points Based 25 Points (25%)	
Juan Figueroa: 20	
Extensive CEI Experience, but the utilities experience is not highlighted.	
Giselle Hipolito: 15	
Clarissa Ip: 20	
Jeff Jiang: 22	
Wilhelmina Montero: 21	

Juan Figueroa: 20

I would like to see more grant management experience; however, for a project like Boulevard Heights, they may be good fit.

Giselle Hipolito: 12

Clarissa Ip: 20

Jeff Jiang: 21

Wilhelmina Montero: 19

Approach to Scope of Work | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 20

Giselle Hipolito: 15

Clarissa Ip: 22

Jeff Jiang: 18

Wilhelmina Montero: 20

Past Performance - References | Points Based | 15 Points (15%)

Juan Figueroa: 10

Why highlight a traffic project?

Giselle Hipolito: 8

Clarissa Ip: 8

Jeff Jiang: 13

Value of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years Points Based 5 Points (5%)
Juan Figueroa: 4
Giselle Hipolito: 4
Clarissa Ip: 4
Jeff Jiang: 4
Wilhelmina Montero: 4
Location of Respondent Office Managing Project Points Based 5 Points (5%)
Juan Figueroa: 5
Juan Figueroa: 5 Giselle Hipolito: 5
-
Giselle Hipolito: 5

Craig A. Smith & Associates LLC	
Firm Qualifications and Experience Points Based 25 Points (25%)	
Juan Figueroa: 22	
Smaller projects, but many are similar in nature to some of our own.	
Giselle Hipolito: 12.5	
Clarissa Ip: 18	
Jeff Jiang: 20	
Wilhelmina Montero: 20	

Juan Figueroa: 18

Not much grant experience; some experience a decade ago applying for grants. Maybe we can use them for Boulevard Heights.

Giselle Hipolito: 12

Clarissa Ip: 18

Jeff Jiang: 20

Wilhelmina Montero: 20

Approach to Scope of Work | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 23

Giselle Hipolito: 12.5

Clarissa lp: 18

Jeff Jiang: 19

Wilhelmina Montero: 20

Past Performance - References | Points Based | 15 Points (15%)

Juan Figueroa: 10

Plenty of references, not on the city form/signed.

Giselle Hipolito: 8

Clarissa Ip: 8

Jeff Jiang: 12

Value of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years Points Based 5 Points (5%)
Juan Figueroa: 2
Giselle Hipolito: 2
Clarissa Ip: 2
Jeff Jiang: 2
Wilhelmina Montero: 2
Location of Respondent Office Managing Project Points Based 5 Points (5%)
Juan Figueroa: 5
Juan Figueroa: 5 Giselle Hipolito: 5
<u> </u>
Giselle Hipolito: 5

Craven, Thompson & Associates, Inc.

Firm Qualifications and Experience | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 25

Craven, Thompson, and Associates is a well-regarded engineering firm with a long history of working with the City of Hollywood Utilities Department, for which they provide outstanding service. Their experience providing CEI services for water, sanitary sewer, and stormwater projects is outstanding.

Giselle Hipolito: 17.5

Clarissa Ip: 22

Jeff Jiang: 23

Wilhelmina Montero: 24

Organizational Profile and Project Team Qualifications | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 23

CTA has a very qualified team, some of which I have worked well in the past. I would have liked their submittal to highlight more of their grant administration experience,

Giselle Hipolito: 14

Clarissa Ip: 24

Jeff Jiang: 22

Wilhelmina Montero: 22

Approach to Scope of Work | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 25

CTA's approach to CEI is well thought out. The City's experiences working with them have been very positive,

Giselle Hipolito: 17.5

Clarissa Ip: 23

Jeff Jiang: 23

Wilhelmina Montero: 24

Past Performance - References | Points Based | 15 Points (15%)

Juan Figueroa: 15

Giselle Hipolito: 12

Clarissa Ip: 12

Jeff Jiang: 14

Wilhelmina Montero: 15

Value of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years | Points Based | 5 Points (5%)

Juan Figueroa: 2

Giselle Hipolito: 2

Clarissa Ip: 2

Jeff Jiang: 2

Wilhelmina Montero: 2

Location of Respondent Office Managing Project | Points Based | 5 Points (5%)

Juan Figueroa: 5

Giselle Hipolito: 5

Clarissa Ip: 5

Jeff Jiang: 5

Wilhelmina Montero: 5

EAC Consulting Inc

Firm Qualifications and Experience | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 22

Giselle Hipolito: 20

Clarissa Ip: 23

Jeff Jiang: 22

Wilhelmina Montero: 23

Organizational Profile and Project Team Qualifications | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 22

Giselle Hipolito: 14

Clarissa Ip: 23

Jeff Jiang: 22

Wilhelmina Montero: 23

Approach to Scope of Work | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 20

Giselle Hipolito: 18

Clarissa Ip: 22

Jeff Jiang: 21

Wilhelmina Montero: 23

Past Performance - References | Points Based | 15 Points (15%)

Juan Figueroa: 15

Giselle Hipolito: 8

Clarissa Ip: 13

Jeff Jiang: 14

Value of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years Points Based 5 Points (5%)	
Juan Figueroa: 2	
Giselle Hipolito: 2	
Clarissa Ip: 2	
Jeff Jiang: 2	
Wilhelmina Montero: 2	

Location of Respondent Office Managing Project Points Based 5 Points (5%)
Juan Figueroa: 5
Giselle Hipolito: 5
Clarissa Ip: 5
Jeff Jiang: 5
Wilhelmina Montero: 5

Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.	
Firm Qualifications and Experience Points Based 25 Points (25%)	
Juan Figueroa: 20	
Nationwide firm, with experience in all of our needs. Some Hollywood experiences. They did not showcase their Utilities projects.	
Giselle Hipolito: 17.5	
Clarissa Ip: 23	
Jeff Jiang: 23	

Wilhelmina Montero: 23

Organizational Profile and Project Team Qualifications | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 20

The firm is well staffed without the need from external subs, No grant experience for utility projects.

Giselle Hipolito: 13

Clarissa Ip: 24

Jeff Jiang: 23

Wilhelmina Montero: 23

Approach to Scope of Work | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 20

Giselle Hipolito: 17.5

Clarissa Ip: 23

Jeff Jiang: 24

Wilhelmina Montero: 23

Past Performance - References | Points Based | 15 Points (15%)

Juan Figueroa: 10

The references were all positive, The experience submitted does not match the projects well.

Giselle Hipolito: 8

Clarissa Ip: 13

Jeff Jiang: 14

Wilhelmina Montero: 15

EVALUATION TABULATION

Reguest For Qualification - DESIGN, CONSTRUCTION ENGINEERING AND INSPECTION SERVICES

Value of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years Points Based 5 Points (5%)
Juan Figueroa: 2
Giselle Hipolito: 2
Clarissa Ip: 2
Jeff Jiang: 2
Wilhelmina Montero: 2
Location of Respondent Office Managing Project Points Based 5 Points (5%)
Juan Figueroa: 5
Giselle Hipolito: 5
Clarissa Ip: 5
Jeff Jiang: 5

R.J. Behar & Company, Inc.
Firm Qualifications and Experience Points Based 25 Points (25%)
Juan Figueroa: 22
Giselle Hipolito: 17.5
Clarissa Ip: 21
Jeff Jiang: 20
Wilhelmina Montero: 22

Organizational Profile and Project Team Qualifications Points Based 25 Points (25%)		
Juan Figueroa: 22		
Very strong grant management team. BCMAP		
Giselle Hipolito: 13		
Clarissa Ip: 20		
Jeff Jiang: 20		
Wilhelmina Montero: 22		

Approach to Scope of Work Points Based 25 Points (25%)
Juan Figueroa: 20
Giselle Hipolito: 15
Clarissa Ip: 20
Jeff Jiang: 22
Wilhelmina Montero: 22

Past Performance - References Points Based 15 Points (15%)
Juan Figueroa: 10
Projects do not fit well with our needs.
Giselle Hipolito: 8
Clarissa Ip: 12
Jeff Jiang: 12
Wilhelmina Montero: 12

Value	of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years Points Based 5 Points (5%)
	Juan Figueroa: 5
	Giselle Hipolito: 5
	Clarissa Ip: 5
	Jeff Jiang: 5
	Wilhelmina Montero: 5
	Location of Respondent Office Managing Project Points Based 5 Points (5%)
	Juan Figueroa: 5
	Giselle Hipolito: 5
	Clarissa Ip: 5
	Jeff Jiang: 5
	Wilhelmina Montero: 5

Tetra Tech, Inc.
Firm Qualifications and Experience Points Based 25 Points (25%)
Juan Figueroa: 25
Giselle Hipolito: 20
Clarissa Ip: 23
Jeff Jiang: 23
Wilhelmina Montero: 24

Juan Figueroa: 25

Giselle Hipolito: 17

Clarissa Ip: 20

Jeff Jiang: 23

Wilhelmina Montero: 23

Approach to Scope of Work | Points Based | 25 Points (25%)

Juan Figueroa: 25

Giselle Hipolito: 20

Clarissa Ip: 23

Jeff Jiang: 24

Wilhelmina Montero: 24

Past Performance - References | Points Based | 15 Points (15%)

Juan Figueroa: 15

Giselle Hipolito: 12

Clarissa Ip: 13

Jeff Jiang: 14

Wilhelmina Montero: 15

Value of Past Contract Awards by the City in the last 5-years | Points Based | 5 Points (5%)

Juan Figueroa: 2

Giselle Hipolito: 2

Clarissa Ip: 2

Jeff Jiang: 2

Wilhelmina Montero: 2

Location of Respondent Office Managing Project | Points Based | 5 Points (5%)

Juan Figueroa: 5

Giselle Hipolito: 5

Clarissa Ip: 5

Jeff Jiang: 5