

**CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA
DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES
DIVISION OF PLANNING AND URBAN DESIGN**

DATE: June 11, 2024 **FILE:** 23-CM-66

TO: Historic Preservation Board

VIA: Anand Balram, Planning Manager

FROM: Carmen Diaz, Planner III

SUBJECT: SF&GM Property LLC requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a single-family home located at 813 Harrison Street within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing.

APPLICANT'S REQUEST

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a single-family home located within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing

STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition: To be determined by the Historic Preservation Board, based on criteria 5.5.D.3.b. of the Zoning and Land Development Regulations.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: Based on the determination of Historic Status, the following shall apply:

- a. If the Board determines the status of the property is non-historic, no further action is required, and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition shall be issued.
- b. If the Board determines the status of the property is Non-Historic, the Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition is granted with the following conditions:
 - The applicant provides a marker or a plaque on the property (pedestal or affixed to the new structure), visible from the right-of-way which provides the historic background of the structure to be demolished. (Section 5.5.F.4.j. of the ZLDR).
 - The applicant documents the property and donate any salvageable information and material to the Hollywood Historic Society for archival records.
- c. If the Board determines that the status of the property is Historic, a recommendation by the Board, based on 5.5.F.4.e. Criteria, shall be forwarded to the City Commission.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: Based on staff determination on provided proposal:

- a. Approved if Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition is granted.

BACKGROUND

As per the Florida State Site Master File, the home was constructed in 1925 (Per Broward County Property Appraiser 1940). The existing two-story home proposed to be demolished was constructed on an approximately 12,134 square foot lot located at 813 Harrison Street. Archival history does not disclose the name of the original architect who designed the home; however, the archival permit history reveals that Cedric Start, a local architect listed in the City directory from 1940 to 1980, worked on the property's additions and improvements in 1964.

Cedric Start was a significant architect who contributed to the design and development of various buildings in Broward County. He designed more than 40 churches, including First Presbyterian Church of Hollywood. His work left a lasting impact on the architectural landscape of the area.

The home showcases Mission Style architecture, which was prevalent during 1910-1930. This style stands out for its unusual simplicity. According to the Historic District Design Guidelines, both Mission Style architecture and Mediterranean Revival Style are the predominant architectural styles found in historic properties along Harrison and Tyler Streets in Hollywood.

Mission Style architecture is characterized by central curved parapets that conceal flat roofs or interrupt sloped roofs. Parapets are repeated on dormers or porches and frequently adorned with decorative edges. Additionally, Mission Style buildings may have generous overhangs where parapets intersect with roof sections. Other distinctive features include arched doorways or windows, bell towers, and arcades. The windows are typically casement or sash style, and striped awnings over windows and porch windows are common.

Archival history and building permit search reveal that throughout the years, there have been various renovations to the original design of the home. This building is significant because it dates from the earliest construction period in Hollywood, Florida. Although this building itself is not architecturally significant on an individual basis, its significance in the historic built environment may become greater as the older structures in Hollywood are demolished.

The property at 813 Harrison Street shows a history of ownership. The permit history shows that Samuel Black, founder of Black's Drug Store at Hollywood Boulevard and Twentieth Avenue was the former owner of the single-family house. Doctor Black arrived in Hollywood in 1922 and is a pioneer of Hollywood and worked as a pharmacist for forty years.

REQUEST

The Applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition for a two-story single-family home and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for an approximate 5,700 square foot two-story house that host six bedrooms, six bathrooms, a powder room, a two-vehicle garage, a pool and a pool deck, and a roof terrace. The feasibility study provided by the applicant concludes that the residence is in deteriorated condition and the cost to bring the existing home into compliance would exceed the cost of a new home. Therefore, the Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home and construct a new home that is compliant with FEMA regulations and, therefore, not at risk for future hazard as a result of potential flooding. According to the feasibility analysis it would be highly inadvisable to rehabilitate the current structure without raising the finished floor elevation.

Additionally, the observation report submitted by ARBAB Engineering Inc., dated July 31, 2023, made the following findings with respect to the existing residence:

STRUCTURAL INSPECTION AND FINDINGS:

1. The majority of the first-floor wood joists are completely collapsed into the crawl space and only minor portion of the floor system stayed in place. The first-floor area is in poor and unsafe condition. The extent of the collapsed floor is to the point that makes it difficult to walk inside the house.
2. The existing wood stair and railing is also affected by the collapse of the floor, and they are in very poor and unsafe condition.
3. Second floor joists are also affected by first floor collapse and appeared to be in poor and unsafe condition at this time.
4. In order to repair and replace the interior of the house, the entire first and most or all of second floor framing shall be removed, leaving only the exterior walls in place.
5. Condition of the exterior walls of this house are unknown and requires additional investigation, in order to completely verify their condition.
6. The one story detached guest house at North side of property appeared to be in fair condition at this time.
7. Much of the original electrical system still in place, which represents a potential fire hazard, due to the use of outdated cloth wiring.
8. Finished floor of the house appeared to be below the minimum FEMA flood elevation criteria.
9. Despite relatively fair condition of this house from outside, due to the extent of the damage to interior of the house, which include first floor, second floor, damaged interior stud walls, damaged existing stair, the entire interior of the main house needs to be demolished and completely replaced with new.
10. Sub-standard windows and door shall be replaced with new, to comply with the requirements of South Florida Building Code.
11. All damaged concrete beams, some with exposed reinforcing, require complete structural restoration.
12. A/C unit requires replacement.

The new home has Modern-Contemporary style with pure orthogonal geometries and hierarchical volumes. The proposal of two-story home consists of common areas on the first level, including kitchen, dining, living room areas, a pool and a pool deck as well as three bedrooms and three bathrooms. The second floor has three additional bedrooms and bathrooms, and a balcony. The required parking space for the home will be provided with a garage and an outdoor driveway accessed from Harrison Street. The new home meets all applicable requirements including setbacks, height, and 40% minimum green areas required. The color pallet to be used in the proposed building are to be a series of light grey tones and smooth stucco finishes.

The Historic Preservation Board is guided by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the City of Hollywood's Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. These documents offer design controls for materials, scale, massing, and location for all properties within the District.

SITE BACKGROUND

Applicant/Owner:	SF&GM Property LLC
Address/Location:	813 Harrison Street
Size of Property:	12,134 sq. ft. (0.28 acres)
Present Zoning:	Single-Family Residential (RS-6) Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLOD-1)
Present Land Use:	Low Residential (LRES)
Present Use of Land:	Single Family
Year Built:	1925/1940 (Florida State Site Master File/BCPA)

ADJACENT ZONING

North:	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLOD-1)
South:	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLOD-1)
East:	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLOD-1)
West:	Single-Family Residential District (RS-6) Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRLOD-1)

CONSISTENCY WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

Within the Comprehensive Plan, the primary goal of the Land Use Element is to *promote a distribution of land uses that will enhance and improve the residential, business, resort and natural communities while allowing the land owners to maximize the use of their property.*

The proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood, while allowing the Applicant to maximize the living area of their property. By allowing the Applicant to construct the proposed homes, the City is accomplishing the desired reinvestment in the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District

CONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN

The City-Wide Master Plan (CWMP) places a priority on protecting, preserving, and enhancing residential neighborhoods. It addresses the need for strict design controls to maintain the individual character of each neighborhood.

Policy 2.46: *Preserve stable neighborhoods and encourage rehabilitation initiatives that will revitalize and promote stability of neighborhoods.*

Policy CW.15: *Place a priority on protecting, preserving, and enhancing residential neighborhoods.*

The CWMP also states *the single-family character of the area should be preserved and enhanced through strict zoning code enforcement, traffic calming and streetscape improvements.* The project has minimal impact on the current streetscape while enhancing the landscaping.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE HOLLYWOOD LAKES NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN

The Hollywood Lakes Neighborhood Plan seeks to maintain and preserve the character and integrity of the existing residential community by protecting historical areas. It also seeks to eliminate the encroachment of negative residential uses.

The existing two-story home was constructed in 1925. It is one of the oldest houses in the Lakes area. It is an example of a Mission style home; however, the existing house requires restoration to improve the deteriorating conditions.

APPLICABLE CRITERIA

Decisions on Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition. Based on the following criteria and other appropriate considerations, the Board must determine if the building is of historic significance. The Zoning and Land Development Regulations does not provide guidance as to how much weight should be given to each criterion.

CRITERION 1: Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

CRITERION 2: Association with the lives of persons significant in our past.

CRITERION 3: Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.

CRITERION 4: Possession of high artistic values.

CRITERION 5: Representation of the work of a master.

CRITERION 6: Representation of a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

CRITERION 7: Yield, or the likelihood of yielding information important in prehistory or history.

Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

CRITERION 1: The building, structure, improvement, or site is designated on either a national, state, or local level as an historic preservation district or an architectural landmark or site.

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines recommend *identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings which are important in defining the overall historic character of a historic district or neighborhood.*

CRITERION 2: The building, structure, improvement, or site is of such design, craftsmanship, or material that it could be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.

ANALYSIS: Presently, there is no portion of the structure or design element on the home or site that could not be reproduced or replicated without great difficulty or expense. The Applicant

desires to increase the size of the existing house that will require a major renovation to the existing structure and will have challenges to overcome without the ability to meet applicable building code requirements. This will be non-feasible, as it will result in a great difficulty and expense.

CRITERION 3: The building, structure, improvement, or site is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the county, or the region.

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines allow for the removal of *non-significant buildings, additions, or site features which detract from the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood*. Although this building itself is not architecturally significant on an individual basis, its significance in the historic built environment may become greater as it is one of the oldest structures in Hollywood.

CRITERION 4: The building, structure, improvement, or site contributes significantly to the historic character of a historically designated district.

ANALYSIS: Staff finds there is not substantial historic character that could be considered to significantly contribute to the character of the district.

CRITERION 5: Retention of the building, structure, improvement, or site promotes the general welfare of the City by providing an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, and design or by developing an understanding of the importance and value of a particular culture and heritage.

ANALYSIS: As stated hereinabove, the existing home does not embody a structure steeped in architectural style or historical character. That said, the home was inhabited by figures that are locally significant to the City's History. Should the Board approve the demolition, the demolition shall be approved with staff recommendations.

CRITERION 6: There are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and those plans will adversely effect on the historic character of the Historic District.

ANALYSIS: The Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home and construct one new home. The proposed home is contemporary and functional, allowing the Applicant to maximize the use of the property. The design is enhanced by a formal landscape plan which includes an array of native species. Required parking is accommodated.

CRITERION 7: The Unsafe Structures Board has ordered the demolition of a structure, or the feasibility study determines that the retention of the building would deny the owner of all economically viable uses of the property.

ANALYSIS: The Unsafe Structures Board has not ordered the demolition of this home. However, improvements, such as increasing the finished floor elevation to meet FEMA's regulatory heights, impede the owner's ability to move forward in manner that is financially feasible or sound. The reinvestment in the property without the freedom of design for a property that does not represent a Period of Significance or possess historic merit would be an undue burden for the Applicant. Therefore, the Applicant purports that restoring the

existing home is not a feasible option and is proposing one new home to enhance the property in a manner consistent with the goals of the district.

CRITERION 8: The information listed in the Historic Properties Database (a listing of historic and non-historic properties) has been considered as a guideline in determining whether a Certification of Appropriateness for Demolition should be issued.

ANALYSIS: This house is not individually designated, but it is a contributing structure based on the Florida Master Site File available because it is one of the oldest buildings in Hollywood Lakes. This house was owned by a pharmacist Dr. Samuel Black who had his business located on the southeast corner of Hollywood Boulevard and 20th Avenue.

Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness of Design as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

CRITERION: INTEGRITY OF LOCATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines recommend maintaining consistent spacing and setbacks and further state new construction should be compatible with existing buildings. The intent of the Applicant is to design a livable space by replacing the existing structure that maximizes the natural benefit of the location while complying with regulations. The new house finished floor elevation required by FEMA is +9.00'; however, the proposed finished floor elevation on the ground floor is +12.0' and the pool deck is at 9'-6". The Applicant is proposing a fence and a retaining wall around the deck. In order to reduce the height of the deck from the alley, the Applicant is proposing a 5-foot landscape on the alley and the property sides.

FINDING: Consistent

CRITERION: DESIGN

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines encourage new construction to be compatible with the character of the neighborhood with regard to scale, materials, texture, and color. The design element of scale relates to the size of the building components or spaces relative to the human body as well as to the larger context relative to the surrounding buildings, streetscape, and environment. The proposed home design represents this current time in architecture, creating unique and interesting massing on the home capturing characteristics of the existing home.

FINDING: Consistent

CRITERION: SETTING

ANALYSIS: As stated in the Design Guidelines, *"...setting is the relationship of buildings within the Historic District and the surrounding site and neighborhood."* The proposed design offers a character to the neighborhood throughout the Lakes district creating a new spatial relationship with surrounding properties. Massing plays an important role in determining the character of individual properties, the street, and the surrounding neighborhood. The

new construction has a finished floor elevation higher than the surrounding buildings. This happens as a result of the new FEMA requirements.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: MATERIALS

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines state materials are an important part of the fabric of any historic district or property and help to maintain the historic character of the place. Furthermore, materials are compatible in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to those that are in the historic district should be used. The design of the proposed home utilizes a neutral palette with simplified design elements and cohesive materials such as stucco and glass. The proposed request is consistent with other modern home designs within the district. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will enhance the ambience achieved by the home’s design, allowing for shade, visibility, and framing of the property.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: WORKMANSHIP

ANALYSIS: According to the National Register, workmanship is the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory. It is the evidence of artisans' labor and skill in constructing or altering a building, structure, object, or site. Workmanship can apply to the property as a whole or to its individual components. It can be expressed in vernacular methods of construction and plain finishes or in highly sophisticated configurations and ornamental detailing. It can be based on common traditions or innovative period techniques. The design of the proposed single-family home is consistent with current workmanship styles and methods.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: ASSOCIATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings... Within the context of historic preservation, elements of design such as massing, scale and rhythm reflect architectural style as well as the richness of the historic district.* While meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design is not consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood.

FINDING: Inconclusive.

ATTACHMENTS

ATTACHMENT A: Application Package

ATTACHMENT B: Aerial Map