

**CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA
DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES
DIVISION OF PLANNING AND URBAN DESIGN**

DATE: November 26, 2019 **FILE:** 19-CM-42

TO: Historic Preservation Board

VIA: Leslie A. Del Monte, Planning Manager

FROM: Fitz M. Murphy, Planning Administrator

SUBJECT: Tal Shemesh request a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a single family home located at 1441 Monroe Street, within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

APPLICANT'S REQUEST

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and Design for a single-family home located within the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition: To be determined by the Historic Preservation Board

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: If Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition is approved, approval with the condition that **any renovations that would alter or change the number of stories or further enclose the ground floor shall require board approval.**

BACKGROUND

The original one-story home proposed to be demolished was constructed in 1924 (based on the Master Site File) on an approximately 1/8 acre lot located at 1441 Monroe Street. The building permit search indicates a porch addition to the front of the structure in 1991. The existing one story home is set entirely within the required rear setback, and utilizes the typical buildable area as a large enclosed front yard. The existing structure exhibits some Mission Style architectural characteristics. *While similar in basic materials to Mediterranean Revival, the Mission Style differs sharply in its unusual simplicity. The freely interpreted vocabulary of design, modest scale and inexpensive construction made it a favorite construction style.*

The Master Site File prepared by Historic Broward County Preservation Board finds the *building significant because it dates from the earliest construction period in Hollywood, Florida. Although the building is not architecturally significant on an individual basis, its significant in the historic built environment may become greater as older structures in Hollywood are demolished.* However, the location of the structure

within the rear setback diminishes its spatial relationship with surrounding properties and as a result does not contribute positively to the character of the neighborhood.

Pursuant to Sections 3.8, 39 and 4.1 of the City's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, the Applicant has provided substantial evidence that the properties were never in common ownership and the lot was originally platted as presented in the legal description provided.

REQUEST

The Applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition for a 690 square foot one-story two bedroom single-family home and a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for an approximate 2,560 square foot elevated one-story three bedroom single-family home. The existing home is currently below the Federal Emergency Management Agency's Base Flood Elevation (FEMA BFE). The Feasibility Study provided by the Applicant concludes that the *home is soon to be inhabitable and safety is required for demolition*. Therefore, the Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home. In its place, the Applicant is proposing to construct a new home.

The Applicant proposes a one-story, mid-century modern style home, elevated on stilts, designed to be reminiscent of the idealized modern era of the Bauhaus School of Architecture lead by Walter Gropius, and Ludwig Mies van der Rohe. The new home consists of three bedrooms, three bathrooms, a large living area, and an understory housing an entry stair, storage and a covered parking and terrace that leads into a pool and rear yard. The home is designed on the narrow lot in such a way that maximizes the functionality of the living space, while also maintaining required setbacks. Required parking for the home will be provided via a driveway and parking area located below the first floor, constructed of pavers accessed off of Monroe Street. The new home meets all applicable requirements including setbacks, and height.

Seemingly derived from Le Corbusier's *Five Points of a New Architecture*, the modern design elements such as an elevated structure, a free or open floor plan, a façade free from structural constraints, ribbon windows, and a flat roof design, enhance the massing of the home. The design of the proposed home also utilizes a neutral palette with simplified design elements and cohesive materials such as stucco, glass, and metal. The proposed request is consistent with other modern homes designs within the District. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will enhance the ambience achieved by the home's design, allowing for shade, visibility, and framing of the property. The landscape selected for the understory was carefully curated to ensure that the material selected is drought and shade tolerant. The Applicant has worked with Staff to ensure a design that fits within the setting of the neighborhood, and enhances the character along the Monroe Street.

The design of the home is a direct response to concerns resulting from commonly occurring flooding with the Historic Lakes District during high tide, as well as the potential for sea level rise. The Applicant has proposed to elevate the home an additional 4.5 feet above the minimum required height by the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA). The elevation allows for the structure to still be considered a one-story structure while providing adequate clearance for storage and parking below. The understory does not meet the City's definition of a story as at least half of the understory is below established grade.

Furthermore, the proposed complies with all zoning regulation. Although the proposal provides approximately 36 percent pervious open area, the nature of the design offers and additional 22.5 percent landscaped area at the understory.

The Historic Preservation Board is guided by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the City of Hollywood’s Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts. These documents offer design controls for materials, scale, massing and location for all properties within the District. The proposed home is consistent with the character of the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District and the design maintains the spatial relationship with surrounding properties in its scale and massing.

SITE BACKGROUND

Applicant/Owner: Tal Shemesh
Address/Location: 1441 Monroe Street
Size of Property: 5,448.4 sq.ft. (0.125 acres)
Present Zoning: Single-Family Residential (RS-6)
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)
Present Land Use: Low Residential (LRES)
Present Use of Land: Single Family
Year Built: 1924 (Florida Master Site File)

ADJACENT ZONING

North: Single-Family Residential District (RS-6)
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)
South: Single-Family Residential District (RS-6)
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)
East: Single-Family Residential District (RS-6)
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)
West: Single-Family Residential District (RS-6)
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)

CONSISTENCY WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

Within the Comprehensive Plan, the primary goal of the Land Use Element is to *promote a distribution of land uses that will enhance and improve the residential, business, resort and natural communities while allowing the land owners to maximize the use of their property.*

The proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood; while allowing the Applicant to maximize the living area of their property. By allowing the Applicant to construct the proposed home, the City is accomplishing the desired reinvestment in the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN

The City-Wide Master Plan (CWMP) places a priority on protecting, preserving and enhancing residential neighborhoods. It addresses the need for strict design controls to maintain the individual character of

each neighborhood. The proposed home is sensitive to the character of the Historic Lakes Section through its design which possess similar characteristics to existing structures in the surrounding neighborhood.

Policy 2.46: *Preserve stable neighborhoods and encourage rehabilitation initiatives that will revitalize and promote stability of neighborhoods.*

Policy CW.15: *Place a priority on protecting, preserving and enhancing residential neighborhoods.*

The CWMP also states *the single-family character of the area should be preserved and enhanced through strict zoning code enforcement, traffic calming and streetscape improvements.* The project has minimal impact on the current streetscape while enhancing the landscaping.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE HOLLYWOOD LAKES NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN

The Hollywood Lakes Neighborhood Plan seeks to maintain and preserve the character and integrity of the existing residential community by protecting historical areas. It also seeks to eliminate the encroachment of negative residential uses.

Although, the existing one-story home was constructed in 1924 it does not, on its own, have any historic significance, and does not fit into the character of the neighborhood due to its nonconforming setbacks and its location primarily in the rear yard. Therefore, the proposal for the redevelopment of the site with a single family home will not adversely affect the integrity of the Historic District.

APPLICABLE CRITERIA

Decisions on Certificates of Appropriateness for Demolition. Based on the following criteria and other appropriate considerations, the Board must determine if the building is of historic significance. The Zoning and Land Development Regulations does not provide guidance as to how much weight should be given to each criterion.

CRITERION 1: Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

CRITERION 2: Association with the lives of persons significant in our past.

CRITERION 3: Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.

CRITERION 4: Possession of high artistic values.

CRITERION 5: Representation of the work of a master.

CRITERION 6: Representation of a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

CRITERION 7: Yield, or the likelihood of yielding information important in prehistory or history.

Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

CRITERION 1: The building, structure, improvement, or site is designated on either a national, state, or local level as an historic preservation district or an architectural landmark or site.

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines recommend *identifying, retaining and preserving buildings which are important in defining the overall historic character of a historic district or neighborhood*. Although the existing two-story home was constructed in 1924, the Applicant finds no historical merit in their study of the property.

CRITERION 2: The building, structure, improvement, or site is of such design, craftsmanship, or material that it could be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.

ANALYSIS: Presently, there is no portion of the structure or design element on the home or site that could not be reproduced or replicated without great difficulty or expense. Staff finds that removal of such elements may be reproduced with great difficulty for their lack of appropriateness for or enhancement of the property and district.

CRITERION 3: The building, structure, improvement, or site is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the county, or the region.

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines allow for the removal of *non-significant buildings, additions, or site features which detract from the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood*. As previously stated, although the existing one-story home was constructed in 1924, it does not possess distinct historic architectural features as an individual building, and it is not an exemplar of a specific Period of Significance as indicated by the Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts.

CRITERION 4: The building, structure, improvement, or site contributes significantly to the historic character of a historically designated district.

ANALYSIS: Staff finds there is not substantial historic character that could be considered to significantly contribute to the character of the district.

CRITERION 5: Retention of the building, structure, improvement, or site promotes the general welfare of the city by providing an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, and design or by developing an understanding of the importance and value of a particular culture and heritage.

ANALYSIS: As stated hereinabove, the existing home does not embody a structure steeped in architectural style or historical character that would provide an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, or design. Should the Board approve the demolition, it may request that the Hollywood Historical Society, or the owner, at the owner's expense, document and record the existing home for archival records. Such documentation may include measured drawings and high-definition photography.

CRITERION 6: There are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and those plans will adversely effect on the historic character of the Historic District.

ANALYSIS: The Applicant is proposing to demolish the existing home and construct a new home. Meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighbors. The proposed home is contemporary and functional, allowing the Applicant to maximize the use of their property. The design is enhanced by a formal landscape plan which includes an array of native species. Required parking is accommodated below the elevated first floor. As such, the proposed redevelopment of the property, if the demolition is approved, will improve the character of the area.

CRITERION 7: The Unsafe Structures Board has ordered the demolition of a structure or the feasibility study determines that the retention of the building would deny the owner of all economically viable uses of the property.

ANALYSIS: The Unsafe Structures Board has not ordered the demolition of this home. However, improvements, such as increasing the finished floor elevation to meet FEMA's regulatory heights, impede the owner's ability to move forward with design in manner that is financial feasible or sound. The reinvestment in the property without the freedom of design for a property that does not represent a Period of Significance or possess historic merit would be an undue burden for the Applicant. Therefore, the Applicant purports that restoring the existing home is not a feasible option, and is proposing major renovations to enhance the structure and property in a manner consistent with the goals of the district.

CRITERION 8: The information listed in the Historic Properties Database (a listing of historic and non-historic properties) has been considered as a guideline in determining whether a Certification of Appropriateness for Demolition should be issued.

ANALYSIS: The Applicant states in their Criteria Statement that a determination the home has no historic merit based on their research. It is not individually designated and a Florida Site File found no individual significance to the existing structure.

Analysis of criteria and finding for Certificate of Appropriateness of Design as stated in the City of Hollywood's Zoning and Land Development Regulations, Article 5.

CRITERION: INTEGRITY OF LOCATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings*. The intent of the Applicant is to design a livable space by replacing the non-conforming structure that addresses climatic conditions, while complying with regulations excluding setbacks. The proposed construction complies with required setbacks and site coverage and does not adversely affect the character of the neighborhood.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: DESIGN

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines encourages new construction to be compatible with the character of the neighborhood with regard to scale, materials, texture, and color. The design element of scale relates to the size of the building components or spaces relative to the human body as well as to the larger context relative to the surrounding buildings, streetscape and environment. The proposed design help to enhance the existing design of the home to create a cohesive and better defined architectural style. The Applicant is proposing a design that is representative of the current architectural styles. The Applicant has worked with Staff to ensure that the design is not compromised by the requirements of the City’s regulations.

FINDING: Consistent

CRITERION: SETTING

ANALYSIS: As stated in the Design Guidelines, “...setting is the relationship of buildings within the Historic District and the surrounding site and neighborhood.” The addition as proposed demonstrates the compatibility between the existing home and neighborhood and does not disrupt the relationship. The proposed addition and other improvements further the compatibility of the home within the Lakes Historic District and surrounding homes. To ensure that the project maintains an appropriate setting, staff conditions that **any renovations that would alter or change the number of stories or further enclose the ground floor shall require board approval.**

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: MATERIALS

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines state materials are an important part of the fabric of any historic district or property and help to maintain the historic character of the place. Furthermore, materials are compatible in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to those that are in the historic district should be used. The design of the proposed home also utilizes a neutral palette with simplified design elements and cohesive materials such as stucco, glass, and metal. The proposed request is consistent with other modern homes designs within the district. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will enhance the ambience achieved by the home’s design, allowing for shade, visibility, and framing of the property. The landscape selected for the understory was carefully curated to ensure that the material selected is drought and shade tolerant. The Applicant has worked with Staff to ensure a design that fits within the setting of the neighborhood, and enhances the character along the Monroe Street.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: WORKMANSHIP

ANALYSIS: The proposed design is consistent with current workmanship styles and methods and does not imitate or copy any existing style or period while complying with all regulations and it fits within the neighborhood's character.

FINDING: Consistent.

CRITERION: ASSOCIATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines recommend maintaining *consistent spacing and setbacks* and further state *new construction should be compatible with existing buildings...* *Within the context of historic preservation, elements of design such as massing, scale and rhythm reflect architectural style as well as the richness of the historic district.* Meeting all applicable code requirements, the proposed design is consistent with the scale and massing of the adjacent neighborhood. This project enhances the streetscape elements of the existing residence and the neighbors. Required parking is accommodated in the understory.

FINDING: Consistent.

ATTACHMENTS

ATTACHMENT A: Application Package

ATTACHMENT B: Aerial Photograph